

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, September 3, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC); Nate Lewis (NL); Wood Turner (WT); Kyla Smith - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Jo Mirenda (JM)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review August 20 notes
- TR for compostables/ASTM
- NRCS Speaker at NOSB meeting - discuss questions
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 20 notes** were accepted as written.
- **TR for compostables.** The group discussed additional questions to include in a TR request focused on compostables. Members discussed ASTM International standards (Formerly American Society for Testing and Materials), Per- and polyfluoroalkyl substances (PFAS), microplastics, and fruit stickers. One of the co-leads will finalize the questions and the CS will submit them to the CS Chair to send to the NOP. It's likely the TR will not be back in time to have a proposal at the Spring 2025 meeting, but the CS might produce a discussion document to gather feedback, then, after the TR is received and informs the science and potential impacts, the CS could bring a proposal to the Fall 2025 meeting.
- **NRCS Speaker at NOSB meeting.** The CACS will be discussing questions for the speaker and welcomes feedback from other members who are not on the CACS.
- **Additional Items.** A member had some ideas for a potential field trip adjacent to the Fall 2024 NOSB meeting and will send an email to members to gauge interest.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

Schedule 2027 sunset review

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	Discussion document	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23. Draft TR sent to CS 5.17.24. TR Suff due 7.16.24. TR found sufficient 7.2.24.	11.7.23 11.21.23 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost Proposal/ Compostables	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	5.21.24 7.16.24 7.30.24 8.6.24 8.20.24 9.3.24	Fall 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.2.24 7.16.24	Fall 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24. Response sent to CS 5.3.24. CS sent additional comments to TR writer 5.24.24. Updated TR sent to CS 7.2.24. TR suff due ASAP. TR found sufficient 7.16.24	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	7.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2011 TR (chlorine materials) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371 TR due early Nov 2024	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Soap-based algicide/demosers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demosers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ	Y Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930 TR due early Dec 2024	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early October 2024	5.21.24	“ “

Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “
Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ	Maybe	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov 2024	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, August 20, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Nate Lewis (NL); Wood Turner (WT)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda; Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review August 6 notes
- Compost
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 6 notes** were accepted with modifications.
- **Compost.** The group discussed the proposal for the Fall meeting and viewed suggested copy-edits by the NOP. The CS discussed requesting a TR on compostable materials to focus on three ASTM standards; polymers, fiber products, and liners for compostable products (which are a combo of polymers and fiber). The three areas are referenced in the Fall 2024 proposal and the CS is seeking some additional information. Members suggested focused questions for the TR request, and the NOP suggested adding examples of each. The lead will draft the request and circulate it to members before submitting it to the NOP at the end of the month. The lead expressed pride at the trajectory of this work agenda item, which includes building a foundation, doing it in stages, and being deliberate as they proceed. The CS will share information at the Executive call later today.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

August 6, 2024

Compost Proposal (MJ) - discuss/vote

Pear Ester petition (FQ) - discuss DD/vote

Carbon dioxide proposal - discuss/vote

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Magnesium sulfate (FQ)

Ferric phosphate (BC)

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	Discussion document	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23. Draft TR sent to CS 5.17.24. TR Suff due 7.16.24. TR found sufficient 7.2.24.	11.7.23 11.21.23 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost Proposal	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	5.21.24 7.16.24 7.30.24 8.6.24 8.20.24	Fall 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.2.24 7.16.24	Fall 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	--------------------	----------------

Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24. Response sent to CS 5.3.24. CS sent additional comments to TR writer 5.24.24. Updated TR sent to CS 7.2.24. TR suff due ASAP. TR found sufficient 7.16.24	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “

Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	7.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2011 TR (chlorine materials) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371 TR due early Nov 2024	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Soap-based algicide/demossers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demossers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ	Y Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930 TR due early Dec 2024	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early October 2024	5.21.24	“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “

Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ	Maybe	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov 2024	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, August 6, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Nate Lewis (NL); Wood Turner (WT); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda; Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review July 30 notes
- Compost Proposal (MJ) - discuss/vote
- Pear Ester petition (FQ) - discuss DD/vote
- Carbon dioxide proposal - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Magnesium sulfate (FQ)
 - Ferric phosphate (BC)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 30 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Compost Proposal (MJ/NL).** The lead made modifications to the draft document after the last call based on feedback from members, and the group further discussed the component on time and temperature. The Subcommittee members commended the co-lead author for the enormous amount of work, effort, and thought they put into research and writing in an effort to improve the organic industry process. The lead will add a sample compost log to the document, and recirculate the proposal before submitting it to the NOP for the Fall meeting.

Motion to accept the amendment to the definition of compost at §205.2 Terms Defined

Motion by: MJ

Seconded by: ADB

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to amend §205.203 Soil fertility and crop nutrient management practice standard:

Motion by: MJ

Seconded by: LP

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Pear Ester petition discussion document (FQ).** The lead summarized the pear ester petition. Pear ester is being petitioned for addition to the National List as a pesticide. He noted the distinction between a kairomone and a pheromone, because previously pear ester was misclassified as a pheromone. A member provided some additional historic context, noting that the Organic regulations do not define pheromones. The lead added that kairomones are essential for apple and pear production. Another member suggested adding an agenda item to the next Executive Team call to talk about possibly broadening the proposal to allow for all kairomones and not just this one. The lead will make modifications and add a question to the discussion document for the Fall meeting.

Motion to accept the discussion document on pear ester - petitioned

Motion by: FQ

Seconded by: WT

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Carbon dioxide proposal (LP).** The lead summarized previous comments and discussion, and the group offered comments on such things as its applicability to container standards, availability to farmers in different climates, and an annotation to limit use to byproduct sources only. The original petition asked to add carbon dioxide to two sections, §205.601(a) and (j), and the Crops Subcommittee passed a proposal for §205.601(a) and is now finishing the second. The NOP intends on moving ahead with rulemaking once both are complete. The CS added a restrictive annotation to the motion and moved to a vote.

Motion to add carbon dioxide at 205.601(j) - byproduct sources only.

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 6 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote**

- **Magnesium sulfate (FQ).** The lead summarized the review, noting that magnesium sulfate has a wide array of uses in agriculture, food processing, personal care products, and medicine. In crop production, it serves as a soil amendment for addressing magnesium deficiency or to improve the uptake of nitrogen and phosphorous. It forms either naturally or synthetically, and is allowed for use in other International Standards. Written and oral commenters were supportive of relisting, with the exception of one, who indicated that it should be restricted via an annotation. Crops is supportive of relisting and moved to a vote.

Motion to remove magnesium sulfate from the National List at 205.601

Motion by: FQ

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 8 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Ferric phosphate (BC).** The lead briefly summarized the review for ferric phosphate and highlighted the inclusion of information from the recent limited scope TR, which helped allay concerns from previous reviews.

Motion to remove ferric phosphate from the National List

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 8 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

July 30, 2024

Compost Proposal (MJ) - discuss

August 6, 2024

Compost Proposal (MJ) - discuss/vote

Pear Ester petition (FQ) - discuss DD/vote

Carbon dioxide proposal - discuss/vote

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Magnesium sulfate (FQ)

Ferric phosphate (BC)

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	Discussion document	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23. Draft TR sent to CS 5.17.24. TR Suff due 7.16.24. TR found sufficient 7.2.24.	11.7.23 11.21.23 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost Proposal	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	5.21.24 7.16.24 7.30.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.2.24 7.16.24	Fall 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24. Response sent to CS 5.3.24. CS sent additional comments to TR writer 5.24.24.	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	“ “

				Updated TR sent to CS 7.2.24. TR suff due ASAP. TR found sufficient 7.16.24		
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	7.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1

Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2011 TR (chlorine materials) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Soap-based algicide/demossers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demossers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ	Y Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “
Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ	Maybe	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, July 30, 2024 2:00 pm**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Nate Lewis (NL); Wood Turner (WT); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Miranda; Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Compost proposal (MJ/NL) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 16 notes.** The CS will review and approve the notes on its next regularly scheduled call, August 6.
- **Compost proposal (MJ/NL).** The current document focuses on definitions and practice standards. The CS will also be working on a future discussion document focused on compostable materials. Members discussed the draft proposal, focusing on sections regarding the standards at 205.203 regarding time and temperature of aerobic conditions. Members suggested edits and will also include example logs/calendars for illustrative purposes to clarify the intent. The group also discussed the plan for the next stage: a document on compostables, for which they intend on requesting a TR. The CS will include language about the next document in the current proposal, to open up the conversation at the Fall meeting. The lead will finalize the document by this Friday, and recirculate it for review and vote on the August 6 CS call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

July 16, 2024

- Compost Proposal (MJ) - discuss proposal
- Research Priorities (ALL) - finalize list and send to MS
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Hydrogen chloride (ADB)
 - Soaps, ammonium (ADB)
 - Sodium fluoaluminatate (mined) (MJ)
 - Ferric phosphate (BC) - TR sufficiency

July 30, 2024

- Compost Proposal (MJ) - discuss

August 6, 2024

- Compost Proposal (MJ) - discuss/vote
- Pear Ester petition (FQ) - discuss DD/vote
- Carbon dioxide proposal - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Magnesium sulfate (FQ)
 - Ferric phosphate (BC)

August 20, 2024
 September 3, 2024
 September 17, 2024
 October 1, 2024
 October 15, 2024
 November 5, 2024
 November 19, 2024
 December 3, 2024
 December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	Discussion document	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23. Draft TR sent to CS 5.17.24. TR Suff due 7.16.24. TR found sufficient 7.2.24.	11.7.23 11.21.23 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost Proposal	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	5.21.24 7.16.24 7.30.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.2.24 7.16.24	Fall 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24. Response sent to CS 5.3.24. CS sent additional comments to TR writer 5.24.24. Updated TR sent to CS 7.2.24. TR suff due ASAP. TR found sufficient 7.16.24	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	7.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	----------------------	----------------

Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2011 TR (chlorine materials) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Soap-based algicide/demosers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demosers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ	Y Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “

Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ	Maybe	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, July 16, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Nate Lewis (NL); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Heather Kumar (HK)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Miranda

Agenda

- Review July 2, 2024 notes
- Compost Proposal (MJ/NL) - discuss proposal
- Research Priorities (ALL) - finalize list and send to MS
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Hydrogen chloride (ADB)
 - Soaps, ammonium (ADB)
 - Sodium fluoaluminatate (mined) (MJ)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 2, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Research Priorities (ALL).** The group discussed the comments they received for the Spring discussion document. According to comments, the top priorities include plastic use, PFAS, on-farm biodiversity and pathogen presence, and side-by-side trials of organic pesticide products. Members weighed in on what to include on the list for the Fall proposal. The lead will finalize the Crops list and recirculate it before sending it to the Materials Subcommittee. MS will discuss and vote on the August 13 call.
- **Compost Proposal (MJ/NL).** MJ shared the draft document on July 2. The group reviewed a summary of the work to date, including modifications made after the Spring meeting incorporating feedback from stakeholders and the compost panel. MJ asked that members review the draft prior to the next scheduled conversation on July 30.
- **2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote**
 - **Ferric Phosphate TR sufficiency (BC).** The lead found the TR amendment sufficient, and noted that it was well written and answered all the outstanding questions. The information from the TR will be incorporated into the Fall review.
 - **Hydrogen chloride (ADB).** The lead briefly summarized the review of hydrogen chloride, which is used to delint cotton. The group discussed organic cotton seed vs conventional, alternatives, and human health/environmental concerns. The CS is supportive of relisting since there are no alternatives.

Motion to remove hydrogen chloride from the National List

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: WT

Yes: 0 No: 8 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Soaps, ammonium (ADB).** The lead summarized the review of ammonium soaps, and the group moved to a vote. There was little controversy regarding this substance, so the Crops Subcommittee plans to minimize discussion at the Fall meeting.

Motion to remove soaps, ammonium from the National List

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Sodium fluoaluminate (mined) (MJ).** The lead gave a brief summary of the review and the group moved to a vote. There is no opposition to keeping this material on the list as a prohibited substance.

Motion to remove sodium fluoaluminate (mined) from the National List

Motion by: MJ

Seconded by: ADB

Yes: 0 No: 8 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional Items.** The CS added an additional call on July 30 to complete the Compost proposal.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

July 2, 2024

Pear Ester petition (FQ) - TR sufficiency

Research Priorities (ALL) - discuss

July 16, 2024

Compost Proposal (MJ) - discuss proposal

Research Priorities (ALL) - finalize list and send to MS

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Hydrogen chloride (ADB)

Soaps, ammonium (ADB)

Sodium fluoaluminate (mined) (MJ)

Ferric phosphate (BC) - TR sufficiency

July 30, 2024

Compost Proposal (MJ) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2024

Pear Ester petition (FQ) - discuss DD/vote

Carbon dioxide proposal - discuss/vote

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Magnesium sulfate (FQ)

Ferric phosphate (BC)

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024
 December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	Discussion document	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23. Draft TR sent to CS 5.17.24. TR Suff due 7.16.24. TR was found sufficient 7.2.24.	11.7.23 11.21.23 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost Proposal	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.2.24 7.16.24	Fall 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	--------------------	----------------

Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24. Response sent to CS 5.3.24. CS sent additional comments to TR writer 5.24.24. Updated TR sent to CS 7.2.24. TR suff due ASAP. TR found sufficient 7.16.24	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “

Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23		“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “

Milestones

NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2011 TR (chlorine materials) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Soap-based algicide/demosers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demosers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ	Y Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “

Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ	Maybe	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, July 2, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Wood Turner (WT); Javier Zamora (JZ); Nate Lewis (NL)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Miranda

Agenda

- Review June 18, 2024 notes
- Pear Ester petition (FQ) - TR sufficiency
- Carbon dioxide proposal (LP) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (ALL) - discuss
- Compost (MJ)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 18, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Carbon dioxide proposal (LP).** The Crops Subcommittee discussed the current draft proposal for carbon dioxide. The lead shared background information from conversations she's had with stakeholders as well as information from the TR about the manufacture and use of carbon dioxide. According to the TR, carbon dioxide is a byproduct and is not being created for this purpose. Members discussed the petitioned use with regard to OFPA criteria, and a member summarized the three main issues for clarification. 1) Source of CO₂, 2) Use as a growth enhancer, and 3) lack of container standards. Members reiterated that they support using CO₂ as a byproduct, but would not support the creation of CO₂ to supply this need. The lead will edit the draft based on feedback and the CS will discuss and vote on the August 6 call.
- **Pear Ester petition (FQ).** The lead summarized the TR for pear ester, indicating it was well written and comprehensive. The TR was found sufficient, and the Chair will relay that information to the NOP. Pear ester is a kairamone (chemical signals produced by plants or other organisms that are detected by a different species, often insects), and combined with pheromones are very effective. Kairamones reduce costs, the need for pesticides, and the amount of manual labor needed, and are very effective. The lead will complete the draft document and the CS will vote on August 6.
- **Research Priorities (BC/ALL).** The food technologist prepared a summary of the public comments about the Research Priorities from the Spring meeting, and the group reviewed them. The lead will work with the Crops Chair to develop the final list that they will submit to the Materials Subcommittee.

The group discussed process improvements for the research priorities, and ways in which they can make the lists shorter, or more focused. Ideas include having the Food Technologist conduct literature reviews to determine what, if any, research already exists, or perhaps is underway. The group is also interested in seeking feedback from stakeholders about ongoing research to understand whether any of the NOSB research priorities are being worked on, and if not, what are the organic research dollars being spent on. Members also posed questions about how the NOSB work interfaces with research groups like the Organic Farming Research Foundation (OFRF) and the Organic Center. Members shared challenges with financial constraints on extension services, and on-farm research protocols that require a strong relationship between farmers and researchers in order to maintain robust scientific data collection.

The NOSB Chair noted that temporary variances for certain practice standards are allowed in the regulations and this [guidance document](#) as well, and producers are allowed to apply for a temporary variance for research.

- **Compost (MJ).** The lead circulated a draft document and asked for specific feedback so it can be incorporated into a proposal for the Fall meeting. Feedback includes ideas, and/or sentiments they gleaned from public comment, the petition, and the compost panel. The goal is to make sure the Crops Subcommittee's viewpoints are well represented in the document, as they make a strong, clear recommendation.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

June 18, 2024

- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Pheromones (FQ)
 - Potassium bicarbonate (JD)

July 2, 2024

- Pear Ester petition (FQ) - TR sufficiency
- Research Priorities (ALL) - discuss

July 16, 2024

- Compost Proposal (MJ/NL) - discuss proposal
- Research Priorities (ALL) - finalize list and send to MS
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Hydrogen chloride (ADB)
 - Soaps, ammonium (ADB)
 - Sodium fluoaluminatate (mined) (MJ)

August 6, 2024

- Pear Ester petition (FQ) - discuss DD/vote
- Carbon dioxide proposal - discuss/vote
- Compost Proposal (MJ/NL) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Magnesium sulfate (FQ)
 - Ferric phosphate (BC) - TR sufficiency, discuss/vote on sunset

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	Discussion document	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23. Draft TR sent to CS 5.17.24. TR Suff due 7.16.24. TR was found sufficient 7.2.24.	11.7.23 11.21.23 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost Proposal	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.2.24 7.16.24	Fall 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	----------------	--------	-----------------------	-------------------

Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24. Response sent to CS 5.3.24. CS sent additional comments to TR writer 5.24.24. Updated TR sent to CS 7.2.24. TR suff due ASAP	5.21.24 8.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “

Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	7.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “

Milestones

NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2011 TR (chlorine materials) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Soap-based algicide/demosers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demosers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ	Y Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “

Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ	Maybe	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, June 18, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Lewis (NL); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Mirenda

Agenda

- Review June 4, 2024 notes
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Pheromones (FQ)
 - Potassium bicarbonate (JD)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 4, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote**
 - **Pheromones (FQ).** The lead summarized the review and members discussed the questions posed at the Spring meeting regarding inerts, and whether to keep the questions for the Fall meeting. The CS didn't receive much feedback, so they chose to re-ask the questions.

Motion to remove pheromones at 205.601(a)

Motion by: FQ

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 4

- **Potassium bicarbonate (JD).** Potassium bicarbonate is used for plant disease control. The lead summarized the review of potassium bicarbonate as well as public comment from the Spring meeting, noting that commenters were supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove potassium bicarbonate

Motion by: JD

Seconded by: WT

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 4

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

June 4, 2024

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Hydrogen peroxide (WT)

Oils, horticultural (BC)

Ash from manure burning (LP)

June 18, 2024

- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
- Pheromones (FQ)
- Potassium bicarbonate (JD)

July 2, 2024

- Pear Ester petition (FQ) - TR sufficiency
- Carbon dioxide proposal - discuss/vote

July 16, 2024

- Compost Proposal (MJ/NL)
- Research Priorities (ALL) - finalize list and send to MS
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Hydrogen chloride (ADB)
 - Sodium fluoaluminatate (mined) (MJ)
 - Soaps, ammonium (ADB)

August 6, 2024

- Compost Proposal (MJ/NL) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Magnesium sulfate (FQ)
 - Ferric phosphate (BC)

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.2.24	Fall 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23. Draft TR sent to CS 5.17.24. TR Suff due 7.16.24	11.7.23 11.21.23 7.2.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost Proposal	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24. Response sent to CS 5.3.24. CS sent additional comments to TR writer 5.24.24	5.21.24 8.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	7.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10

NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2011 TR (chlorine materials) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Soap-based algicide/demossers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demossers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ	Y Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “
Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ	Maybe	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
----------------------------	------------	----	---	---	---------	-----

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, June 4, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

Absent: Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Mirenda

Agenda

- Review May 21, 2024 notes
- 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Hydrogen peroxide (WT)
 - Oils, horticultural (BC)
 - Ash from manure burning (LP)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **May 21, 2024 notes** were accepted with revisions.
- **2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote**
 - **Hydrogen peroxide (WT).** The lead summarized the review of hydrogen peroxide noting that it is listed at two sections. Members were supportive of removing the questions from the Spring posting, and voting to relist.

Motion to remove hydrogen peroxide at 205.601(a)

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: ADB

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

Motion to remove hydrogen peroxide at 205.601(i)

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: ADB

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Oils, horticultural (BC).** The lead summarized the uses of horticultural oils as well as the public comment from the Spring meeting. There was overwhelming support for relisting, and very little interest in the natural oils, stating lack of effectiveness. Members discussed alternatives, possible inerts present in the natural oils, and the need for research into alternatives. The CS will keep the question they asked at the Spring posting to gather more feedback from stakeholders. Commenters mentioned phytotoxicity of alternatives, and a member noted that this would vary greatly based on the crop.

Motion to remove oils, horticultural at 205.601(e)(7)

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

Motion to remove oils, horticultural at 205.601(i)(7)

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: ADB

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Ash from manure burning (LP).** The lead noted that there wasn't much discussion at the NOSB meeting on this substance. Public comments and previous Boards were supportive of retaining this on the prohibited list.

Motion to remove ash from manure burning from the NL at 205.602(a)

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Additional Items.**

- **Consent agenda for voting at the Fall 2024 meeting.** The group discussed a proposal for a consent agenda, with the goal of saving time at the NOSB meetings by minimizing discussion on substances that are non-controversial. Members shared thoughts about the process, pros and cons for launching at the Fall meeting versus next Spring, and how to be as transparent as possible. The group discussed partial implementation at the Fall 2024 meeting to see how it is received and if it does save time.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

May 21, 2024

2027 TR Determinations - All substances

Compost Proposal (MJ/NL) - discuss

June 4, 2024

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Hydrogen peroxide (WT)

Oils, horticultural (BC)

Ash from manure burning (LP)

June 18, 2024

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Pheromones (FQ)

Potassium bicarbonate (JD)

July 2, 2024

Pear Ester petition (FQ) - TR sufficiency

July 16, 2024

Compost Proposal (MJ/NL)

Research Priorities (ALL) - finalize list and send to MS

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Hydrogen chloride (ADB)

Sodium fluoaluminate (mined) (MJ)

Soaps, ammonium (ADB)

August 6, 2024

Compost Proposal (MJ/NL) - discuss/vote
 2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote
 Magnesium sulfate (FQ)
 Ferric phosphate (BC)

August 20, 2024
 September 3, 2024
 September 17, 2024
 October 1, 2024
 October 15, 2024
 November 5, 2024
 November 19, 2024
 December 3, 2024
 December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	TBD	Fall 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23. Draft TR sent to CS 5.17.24. TR Suff due 7.16.24	11.7.23 11.21.23 7.2.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost Proposal	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024

Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD
--	-----	---	--------------------	-----

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24. Response sent to CS 5.3.24. CS sent additional comments to TR writer 5.24.24	5.21.24 8.6.24	“ “

Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	7.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminat (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2011 TR (chlorine materials) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Soap-based algicide/demossers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demossers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ	Y Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “
Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ	Maybe	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, May 21, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review April 16, 2024 notes
- 2027 TR Determinations
- Ferric Phosphate (BC) - TR sufficiency
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 16, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2027 TR Determinations.** Members discussed the 2027 sunset substances to determine the need for new TRs. CS will request 3 limited scope TRs and will list one as “maybe”.
 - Potassium Hypochlorite (FQ). Yes, limited scope TR. This is the first sunset review, as it was just added to the list in 2019. Included in TR for chlorine materials.
 - Sucrose Octanoate Esters (FQ). Yes, limited scope TR.
 - EPA Inerts List 4 (BC). The group agreed that a TR would not be useful since this is currently being worked on as a separate project in Materials. A member asked if it would be helpful to request a TR for individual inerts now, or whether later would be better. The lead suggested delaying that request until they know how they will proceed with the inerts review.
 - Fatty Alcohols (C6, C10, C12) (BC). No new TR.
 - Soap-based algicide/demosers (ADB). No new TR.
 - Ammonium carbonate (LP). No new TR.
 - Soaps, insecticidal (ADB). No new TR.
 - Vitamin D3 (ADB). No new TR.
 - Aquatic plant extracts (NL). Yes, limited scope TR.
 - Lignin sulfonate (LP). No new TR.
 - Sodium silicate (MJ). Maybe. There have been requests for annotations.
 - Paper (WT). No new TR.
 - Arsenic (JD). No new TR.
 - Strychnine (MJ). No new TR.
- **Ferric Phosphate (BC) - TR sufficiency.** Members discussed the feedback from the TR contractor regarding the follow up questions the CS sent in March. The CS had concerns with the inclusion of data used in the original petition regarding toxicity of ferric phosphate products which are formulated with EDTA (line 473 forward), and its effect on earthworms. The CS accepted the feedback and will continue to discuss this. The Chair sent a response to the NOP asking for additional information.
- **Compost proposal. (MJ/NL).** The leads presented the current iteration of the document, and the group discussed the proposed definition. MJ will make modifications based on members’ feedback. Moving forward the CS will segment different components: i.e., at the Fall 2024 meeting the CS will present a document on the definition and practice standard, and at the Spring 2025 meeting, may propose changes for the National List (NL). The group discussed the practicality of the changes for certifiers and manufacturers. The CS will discuss this project in more detail on the next call.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

May 7, 2024- cancelled

May 21, 2024

2027 TR Determinations - All substances

Compost Proposal (MJ/NL) - discuss

June 4, 2024

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Hydrogen peroxide (WT)

Oils, horticultural (BC)

Ash from manure burning (LP)

June 18, 2024

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Pheromones (FQ)

Potassium bicarbonate (JD)

July 2, 2024

Pear Ester petition (FQ) - TR sufficiency

July 16, 2024

Compost Proposal (MJ/NL)

Research Priorities (ALL) - finalize list and send to MS

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Hydrogen chloride (ADB)

Sodium fluoaluminate (mined) (MJ)

Soaps, ammonium (ADB)

August 6, 2024

Compost Proposal (MJ/NL) - discuss/vote

2026 Sunsets - discuss/vote

Magnesium sulfate (FQ)

Ferric phosphate (BC)

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
-----------	---------	----------	--------	----------------------	-------------------

Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	TBD	Fall 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23. Draft TR sent to CS 5.17.24.	7.2.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost Proposal	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	5.21.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “

Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24. Response sent to CS 5.3.24. TR found suff 5.21.24	5.21.24 8.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	7.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “

Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
--	------------	----	---	--	---------	-----

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2011 TR (chlorine materials) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Soap-based algicide/demossers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demossers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ	Y Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “
Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ	Maybe	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

<p>Paper –</p> <p>(o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2. Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.</p>	205.601(o)(2)	WT	N	<p>Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021</p>	5.21.24	“ “
<p>Arsenic</p>	205.602(b)	JD	N	<p>Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</p>	5.21.24	“ “
<p>Strychnine</p>	205.602(i)	MJ	N	<p>Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</p>	5.21.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, April 16, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Esu Obu (EO)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review March 19, 2024 notes
- Discuss Upcoming Mtg and Public Comments
- Discuss Compost DD presentation /panel
- Schedule 2026 Sunset Final Reviews.
- Review 2027 TR Determinations for Potassium Hypochlorite (FQ), Sucrose Octanoate Esters (FQ), EPA Inerts List 4 (BC), Fatty Alcohols (C6, C10, C12) - (BC)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 19, 2024 notes** were accepted as written
- **Upcoming Mtg and Public Comments.** Members had a brief conversation about written comments and the upcoming oral comment sessions.
- **Compost DD presentation/panel.** Members discussed comments on compost, which were varied. The leads discussed facilitation of the compost panel they are hosting at the Spring meeting. NL will facilitate the panel, and MJ will introduce and facilitate the conversation about the proposal, noting that the certification and material review components are worthy of more discussion and clarification. Members discussed the timeframe and end goal with regard to the compost recommendation. Ideally, they will vote on the final proposal and submit the recommendation at the Fall 2024 meeting. The CS also discussed the Market Development Rule's mushroom standards, as there is language about the definition of compost. The CS may mention that the comment period for the mushroom rule closes May 10 in case they are interested in commenting. The CS expressed concerns about the parallel paths on compost and will ask the NOP at the Exec call today how best to proceed.
- **Schedule 2026 Sunset Final Reviews.** See table below.
- **Review 2027 TR Determinations for Potassium Hypochlorite (FQ), Sucrose Octanoate Esters (FQ), EPA Inerts List 4 (BC), Fatty Alcohols (C6, C10, C12) (BC).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

May 7, 2024- cancelled

May 21, 2024

2027 TR Determinations

Potassium Hypochlorite (FQ)

Sucrose Octanoate Esters (FQ)
 EPA Inerts List 4 (BC)
 Fatty Alcohols (C6, C10, C12) (BC)

June 4, 2024
 June 18, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23 7.2.24	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24 2.6.24 2.13.23 5.21.24 7.6.24 8.6.24	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24 2.6.24 8.6.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24 6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23 7.16.24	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23 6.4.24	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24 6.18.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24 8.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23 6.18.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24 8.6.24	“ “

Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 2.6.24 7.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24 6.4.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23 7.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ		Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Soap-based algicide/demosers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demosers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	5.21.24	“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC		Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371	5.21.24	“ “

Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/ NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT		Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, March 19, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Kyla Smith - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review February 13, 2024 notes
- 2027 sunsets - leads and schedule
- Ferric phosphate (BC) - TR sufficiency
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 13, 2024 notes** were approved via email prior to this call.
- **Update on CS work:** The Crops Vice Chair updated the group about various items as they prepare for the Spring meeting. There are 14 sunsets for the Spring meeting, in addition to one proposal on carbon dioxide and a discussion document on compost. The CS is hosting a panel on compost. The Chair/Vice Chair has worked on the Crops schedule for the coming year, including 2027 sunsets.
- **2027 sunsets - leads and schedule.**
 - The Food Technologists were asked to support the NOSB by reviewing the lists for any potential annotation changes.
 - Technical Reports: The NOSB Chair reminded members to include specific questions when requesting a limited scope TR. She also asked that members rank the need for TRs, as the Board will have the capacity for approximately 15 full TRs. All TR determinations should be completed by May 21, which means the Subcommittees have about 3 meetings to discuss.
 - The sunset templates (2027) will be sent to the Subcommittees by August.
- **Ferric phosphate (BC) - TR sufficiency.** The TR was found insufficient at this time and will seek additional information before proceeding. The lead summarized the technical report and noted several outstanding questions regarding data about concentrations and toxicity to earthworms. The group discussed the best way to relay the questions to the NOP so they can communicate them to the TR writers.
- **Compost panel update.** The Crops Subcommittee invited four individuals, and one of them was unable to participate, so the CS discussed a possible replacement who has expertise in compost manufacturing.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

February 13, 2024

Compost (MJ) - discuss/vote

February 20, 2024 - cancelled

March 5, 2024 - cancelled

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024
 April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24 2.6.24 2.13.23	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Reques t?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	--------------------	--------	-----------------------	-------------------

Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23 2.6.24	“ “

				TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23		
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ		Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371		Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Soap-based algicide/demosers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demosers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930		“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC		Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371		“ “

Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/N L		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT		Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021		“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, February 13, 2024 12:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review February 6, 2024 notes
- Compost (MJ). Discuss vote on discussion document
- Research Priorities (BC/All)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 6, 2024 notes** were accepted with minor changes.
- **Compost (MJ)**. The group reviewed the draft document and made some minor changes for clarity. The CS moved to a vote.

Motion to accept the discussion document on compost

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Research Priorities (BC/All)**. The group reviewed the current list of Crop's priorities and ongoing research. The lead will finalize the list and send it to the Materials Subcommittee, who will compile the entire document for the Spring 2024 NOSB meeting.
- **Additional Items**. The group discussed the addition of a panelist for the compost panel, from either academia or government (State or Federal). The leads will discuss this further and will report back to the Crops Subcommittee.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due

Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review

2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR/finalize review

Compost (MJ) - discuss

Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

February 13, 2024

Compost (MJ) - discuss/vote

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024
 April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24 2.6.24 2.13.23	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	--------------------	----------------

Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 2.6.24	“ “

Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, February 6, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 23, 2024 notes
- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review
- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR/finalize review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 23, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Carbon Dioxide (LP).** The lead summarized the review, highlighting modifications she made since the last discussion, and asked for additional feedback. Members suggested questions for stakeholders and moved to a vote. The lead will submit the proposal to the NOP for posting to the Spring meeting docket.

Motion to classify carbon dioxide as synthetic

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

Motion to add carbon dioxide at 205.601(j)

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 1 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB).** The lead highlighted the modifications in the draft review and members agreed to the proposed changes. The lead will complete the review and submit it for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC).** The lead reviewer noted that there was an error in the previous sunset review referring to a 2018 TR that does not exist, and indicated that they are currently waiting for a new TR that will address some of the same outstanding questions. The lead will complete the document and submit it to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **Research Priorities (BC/All).** The lead is seeking feedback from Subcommittee members and will complete the document and send it the Materials Subcommittee for discussion and vote on the February 13 call.
- **Compost (MJ).** The lead presented the draft document, highlighting changes made in this iteration, as well as lingering questions. The group discussed various aspects, made some additional modifications, and the lead will finalize the document so the Subcommittee can vote on the next call, which was added on Tuesday, February 13.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

January 23, 2024

Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due

Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review

2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR/finalize review

Compost (MJ) - discuss

Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

February 13, 2024

Compost (MJ) - discuss/vote

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24 2.6.24 2.13.23	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “

				2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024		
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1

Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, January 23, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 16, 2024 notes
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - update
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 16, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All).** One of the co-leads updated the group about the compost panel. The CS would like to invite 3 individuals, and will submit the list to the NOP for consideration. The list includes: a person with organic-specific regulatory expertise; a person with extensive knowledge and expertise with regulations, the compost council, and the compost industry writ large; and a person with expertise in food safety compliance, and composting at a breadth of different facilities (food waste, yard waste, etc.). A member shared a link to an upcoming compost conference being held February 6-9, 2024, and noted that one of the potential panelists will be speaking <https://compostconference.com/featured-speakers/>. The group supported the suggestions, and the leads will forward the to the NOP for approval.
- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT).** The lead summarized the draft review, commenting that hydrogen peroxide is widely used and common. It's used in post-harvest handling, and has no long-term impacts on environment based on its break-down products. The substance is fundamental and has consistently been relisted every 5 years. The CS will submit the review to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Pheromones (FQ).** The lead introduced the substance, including uses, manufacture, and environmental issues. He also noted that pheromones contain ancillary substances, and that contact with the substance is minimal, as they are used in traps or ties. Two members added that pheromones are critical to fruit growers in the NW and NE, and without them the industry would not exist. The group discussed kairomones vs. pheromones, which was also discussed as part of the review of the pear ester petition. The lead will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (FQ).** The lead noted the uses for magnesium sulfate, as well as manufacture, international acceptance and human health concerns. The lead will make some modifications based on feedback from members and submit the review for the fall meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB).** Deferred to next call.
- **Research Priorities (BC/All).** The lead asked that members send suggestions for the research priorities, and he will incorporate them into the document and the CS will complete the review on the Feb 6 call.

- **Additional Items.** Carbon dioxide petition. The lead asked for feedback from members regarding outstanding questions. The group revisited the TR and the petition, and will finalize the document on the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

January 16, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review
- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 23, 2024

- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due

- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review
- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR/finalize review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “

				Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024		
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1

Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, January 16, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 9, 2024 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review
- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 9, 2024 notes** were accepted with a minor revision.
- **2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP).** The lead summarized the review for ash from manure burning, which is a non-synthetic prohibited substance. There have been two previous petitions seeking annotation changes, neither of which was recommended by the NOSB. The group discussed the larger issue of manure, nitrogen, and carbon dioxide, and drew the distinction between cow and chicken manure. The lead will finalize the document and submit it for the Spring meeting.
- **Carbon Dioxide (LP).** The lead summarized the petition, which was submitted in 2020, seeking to add carbon dioxide to two National List sections. The Board reviewed and approved its use for one section: 205.601(a) - algicide, disinfectant, and sanitizer, and this review focuses on the request to add it to 205.601(j) - As plant or soil amendments. Members discussed various topics, including the Board's commitment to climate smart agriculture, the capture and use of carbon dioxide in greenhouses, necessity, and review of materials/substances for production systems for which there are no standards. Another member urged the group to use definitive language and to keep in mind the role of organic in mitigating climate change. The lead will augment the discussion in the review regarding CO₂-use efficiency. The lead also added that as written, the petition does not restrict use to greenhouses, so theoretically it could be used in an open field. Members discussed the TR, which was focused on greenhouse use. The CS will vote on the proposal on the February 6 call.
- **Research Priorities (BC/All).** The lead suggested each member consider the current list of research priorities and propose additions, deletions, and priorities. A member suggested that because some of the current priorities are foundational it might make sense to consolidate them into a broader topic. Also, other topics feel more pressing/acute, and perhaps easier to answer, and so those could be elevated to the priority list. A member mentioned the need to clarify the term "pest" since pathogens are also pests. The group talked specifically about weed management, carbon sequestration, and trials for pesticides that are already in use in certain regions as three important topics.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

January 9, 2024 - Additional call (12:00 ET/9:00 AM PT)
 Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 16, 2024
 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review
 Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal
 Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 23, 2024
 Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due
 Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR
 Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
---------	---------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “

Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, January 9, 2024 12:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D’Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review December 19, 2023 notes
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 19, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All).** The leads introduced the discussion document on compost, highlighting that compost is foundational for organic agriculture and is imprinted across the Organic Regulations. And noted that it is important to waste reduction and climate change. The standards are several decades old, and need to be updated. The CS would like to focus on updates to address contamination, such as pesticides, pathogens, plastic, and heavy metals. In addition to the work initiated by the Crops Subcommittee, the NOP forwarded a petition asking that the regulations be changed to include compostable plastic as compost feedstock. The group discussed the scope of the document and the role of the NOSB. Topics of discussion included: Organic compost as a commodity; audience (consumers of compost, and consumers of products grown with compost); labeling; evaluation for compost; composting/sorting facilities; the issue of post-consumer food waste; and contamination issues, such as fruit stickers. A member mentioned a push in industry to put stickers on clamshells, and not directly on produce. Even if the stickers were compostable, the adhesive is the real issue. The need for stickers arose because organic food is not getting rung up at the point of sale correctly, and producers are losing revenue. A member noted that the regulations say “plant and animal material” allowed, and asked if the CS should address this? As for sorting facilities, a member added that while it can be expensive, they do invest in sorting and picking, because customers expect a product with little contamination. Several members shared thoughts about this project. One member opposes the use of compost as a means to address plastic waste. Another member asked how far back in the process should the NOSB look when talking about compost. The group agreed that continuous improvement is the best pathway, with the acknowledgment that it’s not perfect.
- **Compost Panel Ideas.** The CS plans on hosting a compost panel at the Spring 2024 meeting. The members suggested a 3-member panel, and discussed ideas for possible panelists. Perhaps a staff member from Organic Materials Review Institute (OMRI) to talk about how compost is currently evaluated; a representative from the compost industry (either someone who composts themselves or advises composters); and an expert on testing/tests that are available on compost quality. A member suggested adding someone on the user side, who is an expert in soil fertility. The group will discuss this further and hope to have a list of potential invitees to finalize on the February 6 Crops call. The NOSB Chair suggested reaching out to someone from the Midwest Organic Services Association (MOSA) for suggestions for someone local, given that the Spring meeting is being held in Wisconsin. A member added that the University in Wisconsin could be a good source.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous CS Notes

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

December 19, 2023

- 2026 Sunset: Oils, horticultural (BC) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 9, 2024 - Additional call (12:00 ET/9:00 AM PT)

- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 16, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review
- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

January 23, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due

- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD
---------------------------	----	-----	--	---------------------	-----

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “

Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting