

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, January 10, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Mac Stone, Chair (MS), Jean Richardson, PDS Chair (JR), Harold Austin, Handling Chair (HA), Tracy Favre, Livestock/Aquaculture Chair (TF), Calvin Walker Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair/Secretary (CW), Zea Sonnabend, Crops Chair (ZS), John Foster, Vice Chair (JFo), Jennifer Taylor, (JT), Jay Feldman (JFe) - sitting in

Absent: Miles McEvoy (MM), Carmela Beck, CACS Chair (CBe)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Jenny Tucker (JT)

Agenda

- Call to Order - MS
- Approval of Notes – December 13, 2013
- Chairs Report
 - Workplan update: Plans for spring 2014 (Fall 2013 proposal list attached)
 - February training - suggestions for agenda/topics/pre-questions? (current agenda attached)
 - Sunset 2017 lists/TR requests
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Travel/logistics for February training. Questions?
 - Deadlines for Spring 2014 - San Antonio
 - Fall 2014 meeting plans
- NOP news and update - MM
- Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
 - Livestock/Aquaculture (LS/AQ) - TF
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Policy Development (PDS) - JR
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- The notes from December 13, 2013 were approved as is.
- **Chairs Report**
 - Workplan update: Plans for spring 2014 (Fall 2013 proposal list attached) - review list, send any corrections to Michelle and the Chair of the particular Subcomm.
 - February training - suggestions for agenda/topics/pre-questions? MS noted that he is working with the NOP in developing the agenda and although it looks very full and structured, there is time built in for questions, answers, and discussion. The NOP asked that the members send in suggestions for particular training topics they would like to see on the agenda. Currently the NOP is confirming participation in training sessions from various USDA staff and offices, such as

Office of Budget and Program Analysis (OBPA), Office of General Council (OGC), and the AMS Deputy Administrator Anne Alonzo.

- Sunset 2017 lists/TR requests. The National List Manager is compiling a list of the 2017 sunset materials and their current status, which she will provide to the Subcommittees to aid in workplan development and scheduling. The NOP is also preparing a memo to the Board with a timeline for the Sunset review. It will be helpful if each Subcommittee can assess priorities so TR requests can be submitted by the July 2015 date. The NOSB Chair noted that it will be helpful to gather information from the community, especially the certifier community, to help determine the need for TRs or limited scope TRs. A member noted that handling materials on §205.606 will be challenging because many do not have original TRs, and because a TR will not be able to provide the necessary information about commercial availability. ZS noted that she is reviewing the 2017 materials list to determine the need for TRs, in an effort to begin the process early. Another member indicated that with the large number of sunset materials, and the associated time and resources needed to conduct the reviews, all other work may have to be delayed. He added that taking a systematic approach and grouping similar materials, (e.g. boiler additives) will help with the work load and will clarify the end product for the public. The same member offered that there is a hesitation by potential petitioners to submit petitions for alternatives because the perception is that materials are not getting approved by the Board, even when the alternative is preferable.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update – MA**
 - Travel/logistics for February training. Questions?
 - Deadlines for spring 2014 - San Antonio. Reviewed the table at the bottom of the Subcommittee notes and reminded the members that February 26 is the deadline to submit proposals for the spring 2014 NOSB meeting.
 - Fall 2014 meeting plans. The NOSB public meeting is going to be held in Louisville, KY in October 2014.
- **NOP news and update – JTU updated the group about the following:**
 - Guidance on post harvest handling. This has been approved by OGC and will be put into the clearance process in late winter (late Jan/early Feb). JTU also noted that NOP may want FDA's input on key sections.
 - Hydroponics: The NOP indicated awareness of the community discussion and questions about certification, and understands that there is interest in guidance on this issue.
 - A member asked about the public docket communication proposal; the NOP noted that questions have arisen that have slowed the development and implementation of this recommendation. The NOP would like to review and discuss this on a future PDS call.
 - NOP is also working on several other projects: An update on overall accreditation policy and procedures; an update on reinstatement process instructions, which will help resolve questions and issues in the appeals process; the board member call for nominations process; NOSB charter renewal; certifier training in San Diego in February; Spanish- language-training in Costa Rica in March; the origin of livestock (rule); and the aquaculture rule, which are very high-priority projects.
- **Subcommittee Reports**

- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW. ZS is serving as Vice Chair for continuity. The Subcommittee is reviewing several proposals for the spring meeting; two from the cancelled fall 2013 meeting and two new ones.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - Update provided by HA. There are several items that are going forward to the spring meeting, which were supposed to be presented last fall. The CACS will also provide a recap or update of Sound & Sensible (S & S) at the spring 2014 meeting. The NOP emphasized that S & S is as an ongoing process and not something that is “finished”. A member noted that the update is important because the community needs to know that the Board completed their part of the process, including review and summary of the public comment. Members asked about the NOP guidance on Sanitizers in 100% organic products, which they are awaiting before moving forward with this topic. The NOP will find out the status and report back. A member noted that she has been receiving a lot of questions about this topic from the community and would like to be able to let people know.
 - Crops (CS) - ZS. The Subcommittee is working on several items for the spring 2014 meeting: Three 2015 sunset materials, several 2016 and 2017 sunsets for which they are determining the need for TRs, and several petitioned substances. The CS voted on classification of Laminarin and deemed it non-synthetic, which means it does not have to be added to the National List. The question remains about how to forward this to the entire Board, since the CS will not create a checklist. Carbon Monoxide has been a complex issue, and the group continues to discuss how to move forward with its review. The ‘Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs’ will begin with a literature review, which the NOP suggested and supported. Likely this will go forth for fall 2014. A member noted that the Inerts Working Group is collaborating with an intergovernmental panel to review inerts and they could have a short verbal report at the spring 2014 meeting. A member asked some follow up questions about the way in which Vinasse is manufactured, noting that there are several sources and final products, several of which are approved by OMRI. On the topic of ‘Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs’ a member suggested retitling this, as the word contaminants may be presumptuous in light of the fact that the goal of the initial document is to determine whether there is a problem to solve.
 - Livestock/Aquaculture (LS/AQ) - TF. The LS is reviewing aquaculture proposals for consistency. The goal is to have all the proposals ready to be voted on by the full Board, and they are hoping that the regulations will be released by then. The general consensus based on public comment, is that the regulations should be released before materials are approved. The group is also beginning the review process for the 2017 sunset materials, revising the fall 2013 methionine proposal, and will have some positive comments to report at the spring 2014 meeting about vaccines from excluded methods.
 - Handling (HS) - HA. The Handling Subcommittee has several items in progress: several petitioned materials, revisions to some of the fall 2013 proposals, and reviews of 2015, 2016 and 2017 sunsets.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - JR. The PDS is working with the NOP to write a discussion document about the changes to the PPM and Member Guide. The PDS Chair noted that they will have an opportunity at the February NOSB Training to discuss the topics and talk about the outline and the path going forward.
- **Additional Items.** None
 - The meeting was adjourned

FUTURE CALLS

December 13, 2013 1:00 ET

January 10, 2014 1:00 ET

February 14, 2014 1:00 ET

March 14, 2014 1:00 ET

April 11, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

May 9, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2014 Milestones	Target date
Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances	Jan 15, 2014
NOSB Training meeting	Feb 4 - 5, 2014
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2014
Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 10, 2014
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	Mar 12, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Mar 14, 2014
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	Mar 28, 2014
Public comment closes	Apr 8, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call	Apr 11, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 14, 2014
Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX	~Apr 28- May 1, 2014

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, February 14, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Mac Stone, Chair (MS), John Foster, Vice Chair (JFo), Calvin Walker, Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair/NOSB Secretary (CW), Jean Richardson, PDS Chair (JR), Harold Austin, Handling Chair (HA), Tracy Favre, Livestock/Aquaculture Chair (TF), Zea Sonnabend, Crops Chair (ZS), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Carmela Beck, CACS Chair (CBe), Jay Feldman (JFe) - sitting in, Colehour Bondera (CBo) - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Call to Order - MS
- **Approval of Notes – January 10, 2014**
- **Chairs Report**
 - February training - discussion and debrief
 - NOSB document sharing
 - Spring 2014 agenda: draft attached
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Travel reimbursements for February training
 - Training Evaluations
 - Deadlines for Spring 2014 - San Antonio/status of documents
- **NOP news and update - MM**
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
 - Livestock/Aquaculture (LS/AQ) - TF
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Policy Development (PDS) – JR
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- The notes from January 10, 2014 approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report**
 - In response to an inquiry about the posting of Subcommittee notes, MA noted that she typically posts them twice a month, once the Subcommittees approves them.
 - **February training.**
 - The Chair asked about the possibility of meeting for a few hours prior to the semi-annual meeting(s) to talk about administrative and training topics. Many Board members felt that there wasn't enough time during or after the February NOSB training

to discuss issues or ask additional questions. The NOP agreed that it would be a good idea to meet briefly before each NOSB meeting to review administrative details, especially during this time of transition. The Chair noted that the members didn't get the opportunity to talk in depth about the new Sunset procedures and feels that it's important to discuss the details and get the process solidified. A member added that perhaps the Board could vote on a motion such as "the NOSB has completed its review of substance X and it will remain on the National List". This would bring closure to the review by the Subcommittee and provide documentation for webposting.

- The group discussed the status of the PPM in light of the changes to the NOP-driven Board management. The NOP verified that the PPM will fall under the purview of the NOP, not the NOSB, and that the PDS will now be an ad hoc Subcommittee with which the NOP would consult as needed. The program also indicated that until revisions are made the PPM is still the guiding document for the NOSB, although some sections do not align with current policy and procedures. There are no immediate plans to make changes.
- MS and MM discussed the idea of the NOP co-chairing the spring NOSB meeting. They will explore options and determine the logistics at the meeting, and will then refine their respective roles for future meetings.
- A member asked about holding a less formalized, brief training before the semi-annual meetings for new members, which would also serve as a refresher-training for established members. The NOP agreed that it would be a good idea and would consider it as the agenda is developed. The NOP also noted that they are planning on presenting an abbreviated version of the training at the spring meeting, including the new sunset process. The NOP is also drafting a memo to the Board about the training, and will be posting the training slides on the website soon, allowing the organic community to view the material prior to the spring meeting.
- **NOSB document sharing.** The entire group discussed the Board culture and procedures for sharing information and draft documents. A member offered that it has always been an unspoken policy that Board members do not share working documents once they enter Subcommittee, nor do they share email conversations. The entire group agreed that it is important to seek advice and information from stakeholders to help inform their work when drafting proposals and discussion documents, but emphasized the distinction between sharing ideas and parts of documents with that of forwarding working drafts and email strings. One member added that without the culture of confidentiality, many people feel reticent to talk openly and honestly about their opinions. The same member requested that emails do not get shared with or forwarded to non-NOSB members and reminded the group that such information is available via the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) process. All agreed that community involvement is crucial; it increases the knowledge base, adds transparency to the process, adds diversity of opinion to the discussion, and could also save money and resources such as the need for TRs. The group discussed possible procedures by which they might include the public in preliminary conversations, such as having conversations in Subcommittee about seeking outside advice so everyone has a say. A member reminded the group that the NOSB recommended an open public docket and feels that it could help resolve this issue. The NOP agreed that the NOSB public communications recommendation could help make the Subcommittee process more transparent and provide the NOSB with additional valuable input, but is still discussing how to implement this recommendation.
- **Spring 2014 agenda:** A draft agenda was circulated to the members prior to the call and the group discussed the format. The main difference between this agenda and the last few is the

grouping of the public comments into two blocks; on days 1 and 2. MA will group the comments by topic within the blocks, as much as possible. MA will make some edits to the schedule and resend it to the group, including moving the 15-minute block for PDS from Thursday to Tuesday, as per a request from the PDS Chair, and with agreement by the NOP. Although the PDS will not be presenting any proposals the Chair requested time to describe and explain the changes to the NOSB structure. The members discussed various aspects of public comment, including ways in which they can utilize comment time in a more effective manner, given that comments are intended to provide advice to the Board. They also discussed how to manage time if the number of commenters exceeds the amount of time scheduled. The NOP noted that currently 33% of the meeting is dedicated to public comment, which is considerably more than any other Advisory Board at the USDA. The NOSB Chair noted that limiting questions from Board members and using the speaker timer have worked well.

- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update**
 - MA asked that everyone please submit their travel reimbursements for February training as soon as possible.
 - Eight people have submitted their training evaluations and MA invited the rest of the group to do the same.
 - MA reminded the group of the proposal submission deadline, which is February 26. Nearly everything is complete, and the remaining items are on track to be completed in the next week.
- **NOP news and update**
 - The Accredited Certifiers Association (ACA) training will be held Feb 19-21 in San Diego and the NOP is leading the Feb 19 training day. Topics will include who needs to be certified; a topic about which the NOP just published instructions.
 - The Origin of Livestock rule is beginning its journey through the clearance process.
 - AMS and the NOP are beginning work on the spending plan for 2014 now that the Farm Bill has been authorized. The NOP is hoping to add some staff members, and perhaps work on such topics as market surveillance, improving the certification process, and comment management and streamlining for the Standards Division.
- **Subcommittee Reports**
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS)** - CBe. The CACS is moving forward with three documents for the spring 2014 meeting. There are a couple of items on the workplan for beyond spring 2014 that are pending NOP feedback. The CACS will give a verbal update on Sound & Sensible which will also include some additional talking points gleaned from the ACA training.
 - **Crops (CS)** - ZS. The Crops Subcommittee has one more call and will complete minor wording changes to two items going forth from the fall 2013 meeting. There are two petitioned materials (laminarin and vinasse), a verbal update on Inerts, and three summaries for 2015 sunsets.
 - **Livestock/Aquaculture (LS/AQ)** - TF. The LS has one more call before the proposal deadline, and has four items to complete. All of the aquaculture materials will be ready for discussion at the spring meeting. The LS Chair noted that the amount of time designated for the Subcommittee is appropriate and feels that they will need the full allocation. As for the aquaculture materials review, the LS Chair noted that the overwhelming majority of public commenters are uncomfortable with the approval of materials without having the standards in place. The Subcommittee is cognizant of the sentiment and will take it and any new comments into consideration before proceeding. The NOP noted that there are other instances where the Board approved materials without standards, and it is not unusual.
 - **Handling (HS)** - HA. The HS has one more call before the proposal deadline, and has completed the majority of their work. They are planning on adding some questions to the sunset

documents in an effort to gather public comment about need. Immediately after the spring meeting deadline they will be moving forward with the 2016 and 2017 sunset reviews.

- **Policy Development (PDS)** - JR. The last couple of PDS meetings were cancelled as the NOP reconfigured the role of the Subcommittee and the PDS Chair noted that there was nothing new to report. The NOP intends for this Subcommittee to remain as an NOSB Subcommittee, but on an ad hoc basis.
- **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO)** - CW. The Subcommittee is working on three items from the fall meeting, to be taken up for spring: Confidential Business Information, update of the TR and petition process, and Seed Purity. The chair expressed concern about the status of the Seed Purity document, and asked the NOP for feedback about its viability for the spring 2014 meeting. The NOP acknowledged the work the Subcommittee has put into this version of the document, in conjunction with OSEC and NOP staff, and indicated that the NOP had no concerns about allow it to remain on the spring agenda.
- **Additional Items.** The Chair thanked the Board members for their dedication and passion to Organic, and reminded the group that if problems arise it's usually a result of their earnest commitment to the cause.
- The meeting was adjourned

FUTURE CALLS

January 10, 2014 1:00 ET

February 14, 2014 1:00 ET

March 14, 2014 1:00 ET

April 11, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

May 9, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2014 Milestones	Target date
Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances	Jan 15, 2014
NOSB Training meeting	Feb 4 - 5, 2014
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2014
Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 10, 2014
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	Mar 12, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Mar 14, 2014
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	Mar 28, 2014
Public comment closes	Apr 8, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call	Apr 11, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 14, 2014

Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX

~Apr 28- May 1, 2014

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, March 14, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Mac Stone, Chair (MS), John Foster, Vice Chair (JFo), Calvin Walker, Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair/NOSB Secretary (CW), Jean Richardson, PDS Chair (JR), Harold Austin, Handling Chair (HA), Tracy Favre, Livestock/Aquaculture Chair (TF), Zea Sonnabend, Crops Chair (ZS), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Colehour Bondera (CBo) - sitting in

Absent: Carmela Beck, CACS Chair (CBe)

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Call to Order - MS
- **Approval of Notes - February 14, 2014**
- **Chairs Report**
 - NOSB document sharing (see email sent March 3) - questions about NOP reply?
 - Workplans - Sunset workload
 - Timelines - one more ES call before spring meeting (April 11)
 - Spring 2014 agenda
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Travel for spring 2014 meeting
 - Deadlines for Spring 2014 - San Antonio
 - Public Comment status 3/13
 - Update on Checklist revisions to align them with TR templates
- **NOP news and update - MM**
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
 - Livestock/Aquaculture (LS/AQ) - TF
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Policy Development (PDS) - JR
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- **Approval of Notes.** The notes from February 14, 2014 were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report**
 - NOSB document sharing (see email sent March 3). The NOSB Chair reiterated to the members that document sharing is done via a request to the NOP not via emails from the Board members. MM added that AMS is the custodian of documents and is responsible for making documents available to the public to ensure there is no unintentional release of personal or business

information. NOSB members may speak with the organic community but Board and Subcommittee documents (drafts, emails, etc.) are not to be forwarded or shared with non-NOSB members. A member asked about the process by which NOSB members would know if a request was made about them. The NOP indicated that the standard practice is to inform the person about any requests, which MA will do for Board members.

- Workplans:
 - Sunset workload. HS, LS and CS are preparing the sunset lists and review schedule so the workload can be distributed evenly. Since CACS and PDS have a reduction in workload some of those Subcommittee members may be enlisted to help with the sunset reviews.
 - The NOP noted that it has provided memos on some previous workplan items (e.g. ancillary substances, sodium nitrate). For new non-National List topics NOP plans to provide memos to the Board, which will help to support transparency for the public and will provide scope for workplan projects, including resources available and expectations. Currently the NOP is working on memos on packaging and peer review panels. The NOP hopes to complete the memos prior to San Antonio meeting. Other workplan items the NOP is interested in including; strategies to prevent GMO contamination, and conservation practices. Recently concerns have been raised about soil erosion or using highly erodible land for organic production. Currently the regulations require maintaining or improving soil quality, while minimizing soil erosion and the NOP would like the NOSB to review this issue and provide recommendations concerning best practices, resources, and certifier responsibilities for monitoring and enforcing soil quality and conservation. In support of this, a representative from the USDA Natural Resources Conservation Service (NRCS) will be at the San Antonio meeting to talk about soil conservation issues. A member asked about the scope of the memo and presentation, and emphasized the need for this guidance to be national or global in nature. The NOP indicated that this new process of providing memos to the NOSB will begin immediately and not be retroactive. A member asked about mechanics of the process: The memos are sent to the NOSB members the day before publication in the USDA Organic Insider.. One member questioned whether they had received memos on aquatic plant extracts and phosphoric acid. MA verified that these were sent to the Board on Friday December 6, 2013 prior to publishing in the USDA Organic Insider December 9.
 - Based on some feedback from the certifier community, as well as the NOP Assessment reducing the workload is well supported to allow the NOP to get caught up.
- Timelines. The NOSB Chair noted that there was only one more ES call before spring meeting. MM asked if the date of the call could be pushed back one week to April 18 so he could participate. MA will change the date of the call from April 11 to April 18. The NOSB chair asked that the Subcommittee Chairs please provide MA with information about presentations for the spring meeting.
- Spring 2014 agenda. The NOSB Chair asked that the members review the agenda and suggest any changes (i.e. make sure they have enough time dedicated to the Subcommittee discussions, etc.)
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Travel for spring 2014 meeting. MA reminded the members to complete their flight arrangements.
 - Deadlines for spring 2014 - San Antonio. See chart below.
 - Public Comment status as of March 13: Less than 100 written comments submitted to this call, and 12 people signed up for oral comments so far.

- Update on Checklist revisions to align them with TR templates. MA has not worked on this project yet, but plans on doing it soon.
- Meeting materials delivery mechanism. MA will send members the meeting materials (binders, thumb drives, etc.) based on their preferred delivery mechanism indicated for the last meeting.
- **NOP news and update**
 - The certifier training in San Diego went very well and both the program and the Board members have heard lots of positive feedback. Many felt that the working relationships and atmosphere had shifted over the last few years and the meeting was very positive. A member asked about submitting a letter regarding an issue with foreign certifiers and MM noted that such a letter should be sent to him directly.
 - There are a couple of new NOP publications including: Who needs to be certified?, and final guidance on certification requirements for unpackaged products.
 - The call for NOSB nominations for four NOSB positions was posted on the website and also sent in an USDA Organic Insider Notice. The NOP asked that the Board pass along the information to their respective communities.
 - Aquatic plant extracts memo. Two members said that some consumers found this memo confusing and asked if the NOP could clarify. The NOP considered sending out a follow-up Insider.
 - The NOSB training slides and memo were posted on the NOP website
 - The NOP has issued a temporary variance in response to the California drought
 - [Fact sheets on labeling organic alcohol beverages](#) have been posted on the NOP website. MM encouraged everyone to look at them.
 - The NOP has revised the accreditation procedures and is incorporating sound and sensible (S & S) principles into the certification process.
 - Organic hydroponic allowance. The NOP is still evaluating the 2010 greenhouse recommendation from the Board. The community has expressed an interest in more guidance.
 - A member asked about Chilean nitrate and noted that the Code of Federal Regulations (eCFR) still contains the annotation and yet the NOP memo appeared to eliminate it. The member asked which source has precedent. The NOP indicated that the memo is the best, most current source for information.
 - The First Latin American certifier training is being held next week in Costa Rica.
 - The group briefly discussed the Farm Bill implementation.
 - The NOP is exploring how other FACA committees manage minority opinions and will report back to the Board.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) - ZS. The Crops Subcommittee is moving ahead with their workplan. 2015 sunsets are under way, 2016 sunsets have been discussed and 2017 are yet to be assigned. The group is doing initial work and defining the scope on the workplan item: Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs Literature Review.
 - Livestock/Aquaculture (LS/AQ) - TF. There were a couple of last minute questions about aquaculture that arose after the proposals were posted, so NOP staff will participate on the next LS call to clarify some issues. The 2017 sunset materials were assigned to reviewers and the LS Chair thanked the group for their diligence. The LS just received a new petition for aluminum sulfate.
 - Handling (HS) - HA. The Handling Subcommittee is very busy with the preliminary work for the 2017 sunset reviews, with 130 materials on the list. One material on the workplan, PGME, will not become a proposal for the fall meeting because the substance doesn't come in contact with food and doesn't need to be on list. The 2015 and 2016 sunset reviews are in progress. Currently

the HS is reviewing microorganisms as a model for ancillary substances review and it is proving complex, but it's a good test for going forward. Members feel that the microorganism review will serve to institutionalize the process and subsequent reviews will be much quicker and easier.

- Policy Development (PDS) - JR. No report. The PDS Chair will present an update at the spring NOSB meeting.
- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW. The seed purity document was posted for public comment and the MS expressed their pleasure at having gotten it to this stage. The Prevention Strategies white paper was submitted to the NOP, but the NOP will hold it until they can send an official memo to the Board to add it to the workplan. A member noted that the Research Priorities will need to be done immediately, so they can discuss them soon.
- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - HA updated the group about the three spring 2014 documents: Retail Certification, Clarifying 205.206(e) and Sound & Sensible. The Subcommittee members have been seeking feedback from certifiers for future workplan projects, and the consensus, as noted above, was that the community supports a lighter workload so the NOP can work on some outstanding Board recommendations and get caught up. The CACS has chosen to meet once a month instead of twice.
- **Additional Items.**
 - NOSB Assessment by Meridian. A member asked about receiving a copy of the final report which the NOP said would be provided upon completion. Meridian will not be present at the spring meeting.
 - The group discussed having a conference call for the full board prior to the spring meeting or the possibility of meeting onsite to discuss logistics and administrative issues such as who is presenting what.
 - The April 11 meeting was rescheduled to April 18, and noted below.
- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule:

February 14, 2014 1:00 ET
 March 14, 2014 1:00 ET
 April 18, 2014 2014 1:00 ET
 May 9, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2014 Milestones	Target date
Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances	Jan 15, 2014
NOSB Training meeting	Feb 4 - 5, 2014
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2014
Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 10, 2014
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	Mar 12, 2014

Discuss workplans on ES call	Mar 14, 2014
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	Mar 28, 2014
Public comment closes	Apr 8, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call	Apr 18, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 14, 2014
Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX	~Apr 28- May 1, 2014

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, April 18, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Mac Stone, Chair (MS), John Foster, Vice Chair (JFo), Calvin Walker, Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair/NOSB Secretary (CW), Jean Richardson, PDS Chair (JR), Harold Austin, Handling Chair (HA), Tracy Favre, Livestock/Aquaculture Chair (TF), Zea Sonnabend, Crops Chair (ZS), Carmela Beck, CACS Chair (CBe), Jay Feldman (JFe) – sitting in, Colehour Bondera (CBo) - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Call to Order - MS
- **Approval of Notes - March 14, 2014** (attached)
- **Chairs Report**
 - Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting agenda (attached)
 - Reminder to review [2013 meeting summary \(minutes\)](#) and voting record before the NOSB meeting
 - Presentations: Please let MA know who is presenting what and in what format by April 21
 - Public comment process
 - Discuss topics for overarching ideas and undercurrents in organics discussion
 - CACS proposal 205.206(e) not a proposal - DD instead.
 - Workplans: Fall 2014 (draft attached)
 - Committee Structure: changes to accommodate Sunset load
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
 - Travel for spring 2014 meeting: Questions?
 - Public comments: Questions?
 - DOIs: None identified (attached)
 - Meeting logistics
 - Update on checklist revisions to align them with TR templates - no progress!
- **NOP news and update** - MM
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Livestock/Aquaculture (LS/AQ) - TF
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Policy Development (PDS) - JR
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- **Approval of Notes.** The notes from March 14, 2014 were approved with no changes
- **Chairs Report**
 - Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting agenda
 - The group discussed various topics in preparation for the Spring 2014 meeting in San Antonio, including a reminder to review the [2013 meeting summary \(minutes\)](#) and voting record before the meeting, and a request to let MA know who is presenting what and in what format by April 21.
 - Members discussed the public comment process, which has been grouped into two blocks this year, as opposed to dispersed throughout the meeting to coincide with a specific Subcommittee discussion.
 - The group discussed topics for the “overarching ideas and undercurrents in organics” discussion. The NOSB Chair asked that members submit their ideas to him prior to the meeting. The goal is to discuss the larger context and overarching ideas, but narrow the scope of the conversation to a few larger topics and give each Board member a few minutes to discuss them. Suggested topics included: member’s representative roles; organic scale (both of which are factors that influence the review process and inform the decision making process but rarely get discussed); scale of farming; Board cohesion; essentiality; and stakeholder outreach and feedback to engage groups that the Board rarely hears from. Other suggestions for topics included NOSB-NOP collaboration, and scientific information and data needed to make informed decisions.
 - The CACS proposal on §205.206(e) was mislabeled as a proposal, but will be presented as a discussion document instead.
 - Workplans: Fall 2014. The group discussed the draft workplan tables that were circulated and members were asked to send feedback or corrections to MA prior to the meeting. The tables will be projected at the meeting in the interest of transparency.
 - Committee structure: The Subcommittee rosters will be changed slightly to accommodate the Sunset load, and several people were asked to help the reviews.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update – MA**
 - Travel/logistics for spring 2014 meeting: Questions?
 - Public comments: Questions? MA will send the commenters’ schedule today to the people who signed up to give oral testimony and repost the slightly modified agenda on the website.
 - DOIs: None were identified
 - Update on checklist revisions to align them with TR templates - no progress!
- **NOP news and update.**
 - There are several changes to logistical elements for the spring Board meeting which include the NOP Deputy Administrator co-chairing the meeting and the seating of the NOP staff at the head table with the NOSB Officers.
 - The aquaculture rule is still in the clearance process.
 - The post-harvest handling draft guidance will be published soon.
 - The NOSB assessment conducted by Meridian will be posted to the website soon, and will be sent to the NOSB first.
 - Farm bill update. The NOP will be hiring ~10 new staff members and awarding a contract for development of a database.
 - Sunset process: The Board has received a number of comments on the sunset materials as well as the new sunset process. Since the new process will be launched at the spring meeting, the

NOP prepared a script for Subcommittee Chairs to introduce sunset comment summaries and will provide this to the members prior to the meeting so it can be incorporated into Phase 1 of the review process. A member noted that since there are no more Subcommittee calls before the spring meeting there is no time to discuss the comments about sunset materials and therefore they will not be able to make determinations about proposals to remove substances. The group discussed the sunset review template and feels that the new process does not necessarily support the time line the NOP has suggested.

- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Livestock/Aquaculture (LS/AQ) - TF. The LS has a very busy agenda for the NOSB meeting. On the last call they had a very useful conversation about aquaculture materials based on public comment. The overwhelming majority of comments were against approving any substances until the aquaculture rule is published. The LS intends on presenting the proposals and having a robust discussion at the meeting, leaving open the option to defer the votes to the next meeting. Two other proposals are ready to be brought to vote: Methionine (MET) and Acidified Sodium Chlorite (ASC).
 - Handling (HS) - HA. The HS Chair asked if it would be possible to have more time between the closing of the public comment period and the Board meeting in order to review and summarize the comments. The HS has identified several topics that will likely be addressed at the meeting.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - JR. PDS members have not met but the members have discussed the comments that were received last fall, as well as a summary document outlining the new role of the PDS as an ad hoc Subcommittee. JR will circulate the document once it is completed. The PDS is dissatisfied with the changes the NOP has instituted, but will work with the new regime in an effort to move forward and be most effective.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW. The MS has reviewed and discussed the comments and determined who will present what at the NOSB meeting. Mark Lipson (Office of the Secretary) will be at the meeting to give a presentation about Organics at the USDA.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - CBe. CACS has one more conference call before the meeting and will discuss public comments then.
 - Crops (CS) - ZS. Two items were carried over from the fall meeting, which was cancelled: Streptomycin and Magnesium Oxide. There are two petitioned materials: vinasse and laminarin. Public comments indicated the need for clarity on vinasse and the Subcommittee has proposed clarifying language, which they will propose at the meeting. They are waiting to hear from the NOP about whether or not this change is substantive. If the NOP deems it substantive, the vote will be deferred to the next NOSB meeting.
- **No additional items**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule:

March 14, 2014 1:00 ET

April 18, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

May 9, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2014 Milestones	Target date
Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances	Jan 15, 2014
NOSB Training meeting	Feb 4 - 5, 2014
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2014
Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 10, 2014
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	Mar 12, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Mar 14, 2014
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	Mar 28, 2014
Public comment closes	Apr 8, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call	Apr 18, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 14, 2014
Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX	~Apr 28- May 1, 2014

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, May 16, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Jean Richardson (JR), NOSB Chair, Mac Stone (MS), Secretary, John Foster (JFo), Vice Chair, Tracy Favre (TF), Livestock Chair, Harold Austin (HA), Handling Chair, Zea Sonnabend ZS), Crops Chair, Carmela Beck (CBe), CACS Chair, Calvin Walker (CW), Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair, Colehour Bondera (CBo) - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Melissa Bailey (MB), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR), Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- **Call to Order** - JR
- **Approval of Notes: April 18, 2014**
- **Chairs Report**
 - Spring 2014 NOSB meeting debrief
 - Finalize Spring 2014 proposals
 - Workplans: Fall 2014 (attached)
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
 - Travel paperwork
 - Meeting logistics/operations feedback
 - Transcripts available ~ 2 weeks after meeting
 - Updated call schedule and meeting target dates (see below)
 - Update on checklist revisions to align them with TR templates - no progress!
- **NOP news and update** - MB
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
- Livestock (LS) - TF
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- **Approval of Notes.** The notes from April 18, 2014 were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report.**
 - Members were asked to send feedback to MA about the spring 2014 meeting, and to send any requests or potential conflicts for the 2015 meeting dates (End April and end October).
 - The NOSB Chair has discussed with the NOP the plan to update the Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM) as it is now 2 years out of date, and will brief the group when plans are in place.

- The group discussed ideas for promoting public relations, such as posting stories and/or short articles about projects that Board members are doing on their own, outside of the NOSB.
- The Chair proposed that the Board members meet both before and after the semi-annual meetings for the members to discuss any administrative or logistical details and to debrief afterward. Pre-meetings have been organized in the past and the members feel they were essential and effective.
- The NOSB Chair has received several communications from Senator Leahy's office seeking information about how the new sunset process will work.
- Meeting feedback - Many members felt that the format for public comment (two large blocks) was not effective suggest moving back to a previous model for the next meeting, the comment could be scheduled into shorter blocks, but not necessarily individual time blocks to correspond with each Subcommittee, as that model was too choppy.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update – MA**
 - Travel paperwork - Members were reminded to submit in their travel paperwork.
 - Meeting logistics/operations feedback – MA will send an email to the Board asking for any other feedback about the spring meeting.
 - Transcripts should be available ~ 2 weeks after meeting.
 - The call schedule and meeting target dates was updated (see below).
 - Update on checklist revisions to align them with TR templates - no progress.
- **NOP news and update.**
 - The NOP will be sending several Insider Notices announcing various publications, including the recent posting on the Organic 101 blog about the “made with organic” claim.
 - The NOP will be publishing several other documents: A fact sheet in plain language on the 5-year materials review process; labeling at farmers markets; the Organic Integrity Quarterly Newsletter with a summary of the outcome of the spring 2014 NOSB meeting; a few policy memos regarding materials clarifications; the final guidance for Materials Classification, which is still in progress for this summer, and an announcement about the Cost Share program. EBR noted that draft guidance for post-harvest handling was just published.
 - Other projects: A couple of webinars on the verification process, labeling for Whole Foods market, and an eOrganic webinar on organic feed. Additionally the draft final rule on Biodegradable Mulch is being reviewed by the Office of General Council (OGC).
 - Personnel updates: Emily Brown Rosen (EBR) will now provide technical support for the Standards Division to all of the Subcommittees except for Materials, which Lisa Brines will continue to participate in, and the PDS ad hoc, which the Associate Deputy Administrator will continue to oversee. The NOP is recruiting and hiring 10 to 11 new people across all divisions.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - **Handling (HS)** - HA: Two materials from the spring 2014 meeting were referred back to the Subcommittee: ammonium hydroxide and glycerin. The fall 2014 HS workplan is very full, and includes the two referred proposals, PGME, several petitioned materials, four proposals for 2015 Sunset materials, ten 2016 sunset summaries, and preparation for the 100+ 2017 sunsets. The HS is reviewing the potential need for a limited scope TR for PGME. In light of the heavy workload, Mac Stone will be added to the Handling Subcommittee roster. The HS Chair noted that he recently had the opportunity to participate in the peer review audit process of the NOP by ANSI, the American National Standards Institute via his company, Zirkle Fruit. The experience was valuable and informative and he found it to be very worthwhile. The Crops Chair asked about the NOP memo regarding BPA, as she would like to commence work on this topic. She indicated that the Board has received a lot of feedback from the public about this issue and is urging the NOP to move ahead with this. MB will seek information from the Deputy

- Administrator and will let the Board know. The members were reminded to re-review the template for the Sunset materials review as we commence with this phase of the process.
- **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO)** - CW. The MS, meeting only once a month now, chose to add a meeting to their schedule since there were very few between now and the fall meeting. The MS will continue to work on the Seed Purity report as well as several other workplan items. Jay Feldman (JFe) was added to the MS Subcommittee roster.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs)** - CBe. The CACS will meet later in the month to determine what workplan items will go forth, in addition to the newly added item on soil conservation assessment. The NOSB Chair noted that she forwarded an email from a community member regarding soil conservation. The NOP let the members know that the NRCS staff will also be available for calls and consultation as they move forward with this item.
 - **Crops (CS)** - ZS. The CS has many workplans items for fall 2014: The 2017 sunset materials, which were assigned individual reviewers and discussion time; several petitioned materials; as well as a literature review on Contamination in Farm Inputs. The Inerts review is delayed as NOP seeks legal review to evaluate options for collaboration between USDA and EPA.
 - **Livestock (LS)** - TF. The LS workplan includes the aquaculture materials that were referred back to Subcommittee at the spring meeting, which will be deferred until the draft aquaculture rule is published. The LS will move forward with Methionine (MET) and Acidified Sodium Chlorite (ASC) and one new petitioned material, Aluminum Sulfate. The LS will also seek technical reports for sunset materials. A member asked about the request for a TR on chlorine in culture water, as this was identified as an outstanding issue. The members will discuss this on the next call. The LS Chair noted that the discussions at the spring NOSB meeting about the aquaculture materials were essential, useful and productive, and will be captured as part of the official record. A member noted that the LS Subcommittee is committed to making sure their notes and justifications are clear in case the aquaculture materials do not proceed to a vote during this current Board's tenure. The LS Chair asked that the lead reviewer discuss MET on the next call.
- **Additional Items**
 - The NOSB Board member nominations closed yesterday and the NOP will update the Board as to the status. MB informed the members that she will be doing a detail in the AMS administrator's office for 6 months and will continue to work on some organic issues from her new post.
 - The group discussed the process by which many items were referred back to the Subcommittee, noting that many community members were supportive because they felt much of it was not ready to be voted on.
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule:

April 18, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

May 16, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

June 13, 2014 1:00 ET

July 11, 2014 1:00 ET

August 8, 2014 1:00 ET

September 12, 2014 1:00 ET

October 10, 2014 1:00 ET (last call before fall mtg)

November 14, 2014 1:00 ET (post-fall-mtg - new NOSB Officers and Subcomm Chairs)

December 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 7, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 27 - Oct 31

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, June 13, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Jean Richardson (JR), NOSB Chair, Mac Stone (MS), Secretary, John Foster (JFo), Vice Chair, , Harold Austin (HA), Handling Chair, Calvin Walker (CW), Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair, Zea Sonnabend ZS), Crops Chair, Carmela Beck (CBe), CACS Chair, Tracy Favre (TF), Livestock Chair, Colehour Bondera (CBo) - sitting in, Jay Feldman (JFe) - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Agenda

- **Call to Order** - JR
- **Approval of Notes:** May 16, 2014
- **Chairs Report**
 - Policy & Procedures Manual (PPM) Revision Update
 - Public Relations
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
 - Sunset review resources
 - Vacation planning?
 - Travel for fall 2014
- **NOP news and update** - MM
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Livestock (LS) - TF
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- **Approval of Notes.** The notes from May 16, 2014 were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report**
 - Policy & Procedures Manual (PPM) Revision Update - The NOP is working on updates and hopes to have a draft by mid-July. The Office of General Counsel (OGC) will review the document and the NOP will update the Executive Team as work progresses.
 - Public Relations - The NOSB Chair is working on ways to promote the NOSB and improve relations among the NOSB, the NOP and stakeholders. Ideas include stories and articles about individual Board members.

- Sunset process changes - The NOSB Chair met with Senator Leahy and staff since the last ES call and has had some follow up conversations. The Senator is very interested and deeply involved in the changes to the sunset process, and stakeholders continue to provide comments as discussions continue.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Sunset review resources - MA sent a list of resources for Board members to use as they are conducting reviews on their sunset materials.
 - Vacation planning - MA asked that members let their respective Subcommittees know if they will be on vacation during any of the Subcommittee calls, for discussion planning purposes.
 - Travel for fall 2014. Louisville will be very busy in the fall hosting other events concurrent with the NOSB meeting, so hotel rooms will be scarce.
 - MA checked with the USDA Tech department about possibly getting software programs for the Board members (such as Adobe Acrobat) but in order to access it and get support, Board members would have to be on the USDA network.
 - MA is currently working on aligning the TR template with that of the Materials checklist. Work is progressing slowly.
- **NOP news and update.**
 - MM noted that there is widespread agreement within the organic community about organic principles and the majority of the organic standards. Much of the disagreement involves technical details within the organic standards and it is important to discuss and debate these differences in the spirit of continuous improvement.
 - Dr. Melissa Bailey, NOP Standards Director, will be working in the Agricultural Marketing Service (AMS) Administrator's Office for the next six months and in her absence several Standards staff members will alternate as acting Standards Director.
 - Dr. Bailey will continue to work on the proposed rule on animal welfare while she is on detail.
 - The NOP published an [Insider Notice](#) today about the negotiations with Korea on an equivalency agreement.
 - Sound & Sensible (S & S) update - [The Sound and Sensible Certification solicitation](#) was officially posted on May 22. It seeks proposals to create tools and outreach plans to encourage and educate about organic certification for underserved portions of the US.
 - The NOP is working on several documents: A response to the April 2014 NOSB recommendations; a statement on nanotechnology, which still needs to go through clearance; and revisions to the NOSB Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM). Revisions will include the following: Updates to the sunset review process, conflict of interest (COI) procedures, changes to the organizational structure, and the addition or retention of citations to Board Recommendations, such as Organic Principles. Most of the document will remain intact from the last posted version. The goal is to have a draft completed by mid-July, upon which the NOP will share it with the NOSB and OGC.
 - MM indicated that the NOP would not send a formal request to the NOSB to work on BPA because they do not presently have the capacity to add this project. A member emphasized the urgency to begin work on this document, noting the desire by the community. Since it will not require a regulatory change, the member would like to begin work immediately and not delay any longer.
 - The NOP/NOSB call for nominations closed in mid-May and the NOP received a comparable number of applicants for the 4 impending vacancies that they have in past years.
 - A member asked about an organic product that was listed in the Nanotechnology Consumer Products Inventory and asked if the NOP would address this. If not, she will do so as a private citizen

- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Livestock (LS) - TF. The LS is moving ahead with 2017 Sunset materials. Most will not require new TRs. Many of them have detailed TAPs and TRs and the ones that don't are not of concern. The LS Chair is working on a written record of the process the LS followed in reviewing the AQ materials. The intent is to create a document for use by future Boards in case the Aquaculture Rule is not published and the materials do not get completed by the current NOSB. A petition for Aluminum Sulfate will be co-reviewed by LS and CS.
 - Handling (HS) - HA. The Handling Subcommittee has a very full agenda (see HS Subcommittee notes for a comprehensive list) but is making great progress.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW. The MS is working on several items, including the next iteration of a discussion document on excluded methods terminology, GMO prevention guidance, and research priorities. In addition, the Subcommittee is working on a project in conjunction with the Policy Advisor to the Office of the Secretary about data collection related to seed purity.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe. A representative from the Natural Resource Conservation Service (NRCS) was on the last call and discussed the Soil Assessment project that the CACS was tasked to work on. The first steps include determining if there actually is a soil conservation problem on organic farms, and if so, are they being addressed by certifiers in a uniform manner. The NRCS may not be able to provide quantitative data in this regard. The goal is to clarify this part of the regulation. The Retail Discussion Proposal is considered complete and the CACS will remove it from the workplan. The CACS is exploring a possible workplan topic on best practices for annotations. The NOP is not supportive of expiration dates, and emphasized that annotations need to be practical, enforceable, non-complex, easy to understand, and implementable by certifiers. MM suggested that the Materials Subcommittee should work on this project, but several members felt that because it involves enforceability and certification it has greater context and is better suited to the CACS.
 - Crops (CS) - ZS. CS had a large number of 2017 sunset reviews for which they are trying to determine the need for new Technical Reviews by the July 15 deadline. The majority of the materials have either old TAP reviews, very brief reviews, or none at all. The CS is also working on several new petitioned materials.
 - **Additional Items**
 - The group discussed the best ways to gather the information they need in order to conduct thorough reviews and do their due diligence, given the monetary restrictions for TRs. A member noted that if they are not able to request a TR they will seek info from all possible sources including public comment, industry representatives, trade groups, expert panels, etc.
 - The NOSB is interested in promoting events to celebrate organic accomplishments and common ground, especially at the Board Meetings. It could be a simple way to promote the message and the seal if this could be accomplished in the presence of organic food and products, such as the organic apple tasting event that occurred at the 2013 NOSB meeting in Portland, OR. Another member suggested having an "Organic Day" of celebration, akin to Earth day, and asked the NOP Deputy Administrator to explore the possibility. The group also discussed ways to incorporate fun and inclusive ideas into the Board meeting to help promote organic.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule:

May 16, 2014 2014 1:00 ET

June 13, 2014 1:00 ET

July 11, 2014 1:00 ET

August 8, 2014 1:00 ET

September 12, 2014 1:00 ET

October 10, 2014 1:00 ET (last call before fall mtg)

November 14, 2014 1:00 ET (post-fall-mtg - new NOSB Officers and Subcomm Chairs)

December 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 7, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 27 - Oct 31

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, July 11, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Jean Richardson (JR), NOSB Chair, John Foster (JFo), NOSB Vice Chair, Harold Austin (HA), Handling Chair, Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Crops Chair, Colehour Bondera (CBo) - sitting in

Absent: Carmela Beck (CBe), CACS Chair, Mac Stone (MS), NOSB Secretary, Tracy Favre (TF), Livestock Chair, Calvin Walker (CW), Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Agenda

- **Call to Order** - JR
- **Approval of Notes:** June 13, 2014
- **Chairs Report**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
 - Sunset review TR requests. Chairs send to Lisa B, with copy to MA and EBR
 - Update about 2015 meeting locations.
- **NOP news and update** - MM
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
 - Livestock (LS) - TF
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- **Approval of Notes.** The notes from June 13, 2014 approved with no changes
- **Chairs Report**
 - The Chair acknowledged and thanked everyone for their hard work throughout the 2017 Sunset TR determination process and expressed her appreciation for the support and team work that the members provided, especially the members of the Livestock and Handling Subcommittees who volunteered to take on additional work to help one of their colleagues.
 - The Chair noted several activities she is engaged in to improve public relations, and build community support. She is in the process of collecting articles about retiring board members. She recently filmed an educational video about organic principles, which is available on YouTube. She, along with Miles McEvoy, NOP Deputy Administrator, will be speaking at (Northeast Organic Dairy Producers Association (NODPA) in September, and she will also be speaking at the National Association of State Departments of Agriculture (NASDA) in September.

The NOSB Chair noted that she is available and willing to speak elsewhere, as a Board representative, to support the Board and its relationships with the community.

- The Organic Trade Association (OTA) sent an email alert to its members about the impending NOSB sunset reviews, drawing people's attention to the need for them to get involved in the public comment period and review process early. The Chair noted that this is very useful as it will encourage stakeholders to get involved early.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Sunset review TR requests. As the TR requests are finalized, the Subcommittee Chairs should send them to the National List Manager (Lisa Brines) with a copy to MA and EBR.
 - The 2015 meeting locations for the semi-annual NOSB meeting have been tentatively reserved: La Jolla, CA for spring 2015 and Stowe, VT for fall 2015. MA will provide more details as plans are solidified. A member asked about adding a potential location to the list of candidates, and suggested Gainesville FL for 2016.
- **NOP news and update.**
 - The NOP is in the process of updating the Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM) and hopes to have it completed this month.
 - The Korea equivalency agreement, announced in June, was signed and is nearly complete.
 - The NOP is moving forward on several projects that are in various stages of clearance: Origin of Livestock, Animal Welfare Standards, and the Aquaculture Rule. The goal is to have proposed rules published by early 2015. Additionally, the Classification of Materials Guidance should be published soon.
 - A member asked about the petition that was sent to the USDA regarding the language in the NOSB Charter about an expiration date. The Deputy Administrator clarified that the Charter expires every two years and must be renewed, but it does not mean that the NOSB can be dissolved if it is not. According to FACA if the Charter is not renewed the Board cannot meet to make deliberations. He also noted that the USDA was preparing an official response to the petition.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Each of the Subcommittee Chairs gave a brief update about the 2017 Sunset TR requests. The Subcommittees have made exceptional progress reviewing 200+ materials that are due to Sunset in 2017. The reviews will be completed next week (August 15) and the Chairs will forward the requests to the NOP.
 - Handling (HS) - HA. Will request several TRs for the 2017 Sunset materials, some limited scope. Ancillary substances are hindering the process a little. Many of the TAPs are 20 years old, and the members feel these should be updated. The Handling Subcommittee is discussing potential panelists for the fall 2014 meeting panel on Boiler Water Additives and will compile a list of names to send to NOP. There are several new petitions that have yet to be assigned reviewers.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW. ZS provided the update. The group is currently working on two documents: Terminology for Excluded Methods and GMO Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling, for which the NOP sent a memo.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe. The Chair indicated that the Subcommittee is making good progress on the Assessment of Soil Conservation Practices document, which will likely be presented as a discussion document at the fall 2014 meeting. The CACS is also planning on sending a request to the NOP to add an item to the workplan on Best Practices and Use of Annotations in proposals.
 - Crops (CS) - ZS. The CS had a large list of 2017 Sunset materials and now that they are nearly finalized they will move forward with other priorities and petitions. Some are currently awaiting TRs that are in development.

- Livestock (LS) - TF. JR provided update about 2017 Sunset status. The LS will complete their list this week.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule:

June 13, 2014 1:00 ET

July 11, 2014 1:00 ET

August 8, 2014 1:00 ET

September 12, 2014 1:00 ET

October 10, 2014 1:00 ET (last call before fall mtg)

November 14, 2014 1:00 ET (post-fall-mtg - new NOSB Officers and Subcomm Chairs)

December 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 7, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 27 - Oct 31

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, August 8, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Jean Richardson (JR), NOSB Chair, John Foster (JFo), NOSB Vice Chair, Mac Stone (MS), NOSB Secretary, Harold Austin (HA), Handling Chair, Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Crops Chair, Carmela Beck (CBe), CACS Chair, Tracy Favre (TF), Livestock Chair, Calvin Walker (CW), Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair, Jay Feldman (JFe) - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Jenny Tucker (JT), Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Agenda

- **Call to Order** - JR
- **Approval of Notes:** July 11, 2014
- **Chairs Report**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
 - Sunset review TR requests (templates in Dropbox)
 - Update about 2015 meeting locations
 - Draft fall 2014 Agenda - Louisville
- **NOP news and update** - MM
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
 - Livestock (LS) – TF
 - Handling (HS) - HA
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- **Approval of Notes.** The notes from July 11, 2014 were approved with minor changes and pending review by the deputy administrator. MA will redistribute the notes if there are any changes.
- **Chairs Report**
 - The Chair discussed preparations for the fall meeting now that the Sunset 2017 work is completed.
 - JR noted several activities she is involved with, in an effort to build partnerships with stakeholders. She recently finished an article for the Northeast Organic Dairy Producers Association (NODPA) and will be speaking at NODPA in September. The NOSB Chair was interviewed by Cornucopia for an article about the NOSB. JR noted that the interview went well and she was very impressed with the interviewer, Elizabeth Wolfe. The Chair has asked to review a proof of the article before it is published.

- The Chair noted that she is receiving lots of phone calls from a wide range of stakeholders and most are about the Sunset process.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - EBR updated the ES on the status of the sunset review TR requests. The first group of requests has been sent to the contractors; others will follow. The 2015 meeting locations for the semi-annual NOSB meeting have been tentatively reserved: La Jolla, CA for spring 2015 and Stowe, VT for fall 2015. MA will provide more details as plans are solidified. A member asked about adding a potential location to the list of candidates, and suggested Gainesville FL for 2016.
 - The fall 2014 draft agenda was sent to the ES members prior to the call and MA asked for feedback and suggestions.
 - The group discussed the sunset template examples that were recently sent to the Board Members. The Crops Subcommittee requested these examples in an effort to clarify the process for consistency. Many members suggested changing the names of the templates for clarity, specifically eliminating the use of the term “preliminary” review. EBR will change the titles to first posting, second posting, and final review and will send them back to the group. Members discussed the Subcommittee voting process for the sunset materials. ZS crafted some language to include in the proposals for the second posting that will indicate the Subcommittee’s process, i.e. the intent to vote to remove everything from the National List so the materials can move out of Subcommittee to the full Board for vote. ZS will send the language to JR, EBR and HA. The group discussed the best strategy for voting for sunset materials, and considered that the most efficient way would be to vote for materials as a group, (e.g. materials on 205.605(a) that are all recommended for continued allowance on the list), and vote on proposals to remove substances separately, as prior Boards have done. This will be the most efficient way for the 2017 Sunset Cycle, since there are nearly 200 materials under review. The 2015 sunsets will be voted individually, as there are only 7.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - The Accreditation and International Activities Division (AIA) has received lots of positive feedback about the Korean Equivalency arrangement. There are three new AIA managers; all with strong backgrounds in Organic.
 - The American National Standards Institute (ANSI) peer review of NOP is in progress. Onsite interviews were completed, and once the audit is complete the NOP will release the results with comments about corrective actions.
 - The Compliance and Enforcement Division (C & E) has continued to see an increase in the number of complaints. A member asked if there was a specific area of organic that had increased. JT noted that it has been a consistent trend that approximately 60% of total complaints are about uncertified operations. While the reasons for this increase aren’t certain, it might be attributed to increased customer awareness.
 - End of fiscal-year activities for NOP are underway. TR requests are being sent to contractors and the NOP is seeking ways to decrease the turnaround time for the technical reports.
 - The NOSB nominations included lots of strong candidates and diversity from across the organic community. Currently in evaluation phase.
 - JR asked about the progress on the revisions to the Policy and Procedures Manual. JT deferred to the deputy administrator since he is leading that effort.
 - The Classification of Materials Guidance is currently in the work queue.
 - A member asked about the Animal Welfare guidance. NOP indicated that this is a high priority for NOP and a team has been designated to work on it. No deadline was identified as of yet.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**

- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW. MS meets only once a month and will meet next week. They are currently working on three projects including a written report on Seed Purity that is not part of fall agenda.
- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe. The CACS is working in the soil assessment draft. The CACS Chair will send the draft to all the Subcommittee Chairs so they can provide input and feedback.
- Crops (CS) - ZS. The CS has several petitioned items on the workplan that will not be ready for the fall 2014 meeting as some are still waiting for TRs. The CS Chair noted the projects that will be discussed at the fall 2014 NOSB meeting, including an update on Inerts. In the course of determining TR needs for 2017, the CS chose to request a TR for one class of Inerts that are not permitted under the standards of the EPA's program Design for the Environment. LB told the group that the final determinations for the 2017 TR requests would be completed by September 6. The NOSB Chair asked for added information about which TR's would not be requested, so the Subcommittees can determine how to proceed with their reviews. The timing will be crucial for the spring 2014 meeting.
- Livestock (LS) - TF. The LS completed their 2017 sunset TR request list early, and are working on reviews for a couple of new petitions. The LS Chair noted that there are a significant number of materials on the workplan, such as the 10 aquaculture materials, but the fall meeting agenda will be fairly light. The LS discussed methionine extensively on last call as they continue to work on a resolution that will be acceptable to the entire board. The Chair is working on a legacy document describing the review process for the aquaculture materials so future boards have a reference guide that includes an historical aspect in case the aquaculture materials do not progress soon. MET continues to be a complicated proposal. A member asked if the NOP animal welfare guidance contains pertinent information that might have bearing on the MET issue, and could help inform the LS's work on this issue. The NOP noted that the work is not that far along yet, and in some cases NOP has done newsletter articles to provide an update before a proposed rule is published.
- Handling (HS) - HA. The HS Chair updated the group on the 2017 TR requests, some of which were for materials that are innocuous, but had very old TAPs or TRs. The Chair added that this is something to think about for future reviews. The HS added one conference call so they could complete the 2014 fall agenda items. There are three petitioned items, one of which is waiting for the final guidance on Post Harvest Handling (PHH). Although the draft guidance is out, the final version won't be completed in time for fall meeting. The boiler water additives materials will go forth for spring 2015, after the group discusses these further. The HS had tentatively planned to have a panel on boiler water additives at the fall meeting, but would like to seek more public comment first.
- **Additional Items**
 - The group provided some feedback about the draft agenda and the comment blocks. Based on earlier feedback the group asked that the comment blocks be parsed out over 3 days instead of condensed into two large blocks.
 - The members discussed various aspects of the fall 2014 meeting such as guest speakers, logistics, media presence and the potential for protests.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule:

August 8, 2014 1:00 ET

September 12, 2014 1:00 ET

October 10, 2014 1:00 ET (last call before fall mtg)

November 14, 2014 1:00 ET (post-fall-mtg - new NOSB Officers and Subcomm Chairs)

December 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 7, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 28 - Oct 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, September 12, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Jean Richardson (JR), NOSB Chair, John Foster (JFo), NOSB Vice Chair, Harold Austin (HA), Handling Chair, Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Crops Chair, , Tracy Favre (TF), Livestock Chair, Calvin Walker (CW), Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair, Carmela Beck (CBe), CACS Chair, Jay Feldman (JFe) - sitting in, Colehour Bondera (CBo) - sitting in

Absent: Mac Stone (MS), NOSB Secretary

Staff: Lisa Brines (LB), Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Agenda

- **Call to Order** - JR
- **Approval of Notes:** August 8, 2014
- **Chairs Report**
 - Meeting in October - Parliamentarian, DFO and Chair
 - Subcommittee calls for November 4th (HS, CS, LS) - cancel? November 11 (MS, PDS, CACS) - move?
 - Aquaculture subcommittee/materials review
 - PDS reactivation
 - Sunset TR requests
 - Sunset Motions
 - PR
 - 2015 workplan items
 - NOSB opinion about NOP response to Spring Recommendations
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
 - Comments/oral and written
 - Meeting materials poll sent
 - Travel plans
 - Update to meeting notes re: TR requests
- **NOP news and update** - MM
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
 - Livestock (LS) - TF
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order

- **Notes from August 8, 2014** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report**
 - October 2014 meeting - Dr. Jennifer Tucker of NOP be the Parliamentarian at the fall 2014 meeting. Dr. Lisa Brines has provided this support previously. The tentative meeting agenda posted on the website was altered to clarify that the NOSB Chair will chair the meeting and not the NOP Deputy Administrator.
 - MA will cancel the Subcommittee calls for November 4th (HS, CS, LS) as they fall immediately after the fall 2014 NOSB meeting. November 11 is Veteran's Day and MA will see about moving the MS, PDS, and CACS calls.
 - Aquaculture (AQ) Subcommittee/materials review. When the AQ proposed rule is released next year, the NOSB Chair suggests that the NOP set up an Aquaculture Subcommittee to work on AQ materials. Other members supported this idea as this topic will likely require a group who can focus solely on these materials. The NOP will discuss this idea and provide feedback.
 - Policy Development Subcommittee (PDS) reactivation. The PDS workplan was modified by the NOP in February and the PDS has not met since. The Chair informed the group that the Deputy Administrator recently suggested reactivating the PDS and requested that the PDS write a request to the NOP asking to be reactivated. The PDS will be meeting next week. Several members were supportive of this approach but requested that the NOP be explicit about what the Subcommittee role will be and what the group can and cannot work on.
 - Sunset TR requests. The NOSB Chair asked for confirmation from the Subcommittee Chairs about the 2017 Sunset materials TRs indicating whether or not they have what they need to move forward. She asked for feedback about any TRs that were not approved that they feel are critical, so she can forward the feedback to the NOP for consideration. The HS Chair noted that all of their TR requests were approved except for two, and they will be sending a follow up request to the NOP about these. The Chair suggested that the Subcommittees request any TRs they feel they need.
 - Sunset Motions. The group discussed the sunset voting procedure and how best to make it clear to everyone what a vote actually means (e.g. since members are voting to remove everything, it needs to be clear what a vote on such a motion will mean.) The group discussed the voting process that was used in Subcommittee to move proposals out of Subcommittee to the full Board.
 - Public relations. The NOSB Chair gave a talk at the annual meeting of the National Association of State Departments of Agriculture (NASDA). Betsy Rakola, USDA Organic Policy Advisor, was also in attendance representing the NOP. The Chair noted that this was the first time organic was a topic at this meeting. Cornucopia will publish an article with an interview they conducted with the NOSB Chair. A member encouraged more coordination with State groups because they tend to be underutilized and often have funds.
 - 2015 workplan items. The members had no feedback on the draft list, which contains a summary of items that have been on the workplan since the spring 2014 meeting that are not going to be completed at the fall 2014 meeting.
 - NOP response to spring recommendations. A stakeholder contacted the NOSB Chair and asked for the NOSBs opinion about the NOP response. The NOSB feels the response was appropriate.

- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Comments/oral and written. The comment period opened this week and there are 19 oral commenters signed up and only 4 written comments so far. A member indicated that there was some confusion in the community about when people will be able to comment. MA will add some clarifying language to the fall agenda.
 - MA sent the meeting material's poll to members asking how they would like the materials delivered.
 - Travel plans are underway. Members can call the travel agent and make their flight reservations. The hotel block is nearly full already.
 - Update to meeting notes re: TR requests. MA will update the tables in the Subcommittee notes to reflect the TR requests that were submitted by the NOP.
 - The Declaration of Interest (DOI) spreadsheet will be sent to members soon.
- **NOP news and update - LB.** The NOP has recently published several blogs, and Insider notices with stakeholder announcements. Insider notices included a recruiting announcement for three new positions with the NOP Standards Division, and an announcement about Betsy Rakola's new position as USDA Organic Policy Advisor. In response to a member's question about the Classification of Materials final guidance, LB noted that it will likely not be published before the fall 2014 Board meeting, but she hopes to have an update by then. The Post Harvest Handling guidance is still in development and the NOP is hoping it will be published by year end. A member asked about having the four new Board members sit in on conference calls prior to their appointment as a way to observe the process so they are more prepared once their terms start.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - CBe. The CACS will have one discussion document for the fall 2014 meeting on soil conservation practices.
 - Crops (CS) - ZS. The CS Chair emphasized the need for Subcommittee members to submit documents with enough time for people to review and participate in conversations. Having the maximum amount of time to review documents prior to the calls is critical for members to be able to provide useful analysis
 - Livestock (LS) - TF. The LS had a guest speaker on the last call to discuss research into high methionine corn. The MET proposal is in progress but has stalled while the Livestock Subcommittee works to compromise on various aspects. The LS has no 2015 sunset materials but has a significant number of 2017 materials that will be presented at the fall 2014 meeting. The LS Chair is working on an aquaculture (AQ) legacy document to document the review processes to date. This will be beneficial for future Boards if the aquaculture rule does not get published in time for the current members to complete the reviews.
 - Handling (HS) - HA. The HS has several proposals in progress, and has received a couple of new petitions. HA urged members to consult with the outgoing members in order to prep for the onslaught of 2017 sunset materials. The HS will focus on public comment summaries for the next two calls.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW. The MS has two documents for the fall meeting: Excluded Methods Terminology and fall 2014 Research Priorities. During the call this past week, the group discussed a new petition regarding an antimicrobial active ingredient. CW called for a special celebration at the meeting for the outgoing members.
- **Additional Items - none**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule:

August 8, 2014 1:00 ET

September 12, 2014 1:00 ET

October 17, 2014 1:00 ET (last call before fall mtg) – note: this call was moved to one week later than normal

November 14, 2014 1:00 ET (post-fall-mtg - new NOSB Officers and Subcomm Chairs)

December 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 7, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 27 - Oct 31

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, October 17, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Jean Richardson (JR), NOSB Chair, John Foster (JFo), NOSB Vice Chair, Mac Stone (MS), NOSB Secretary, Harold Austin (HA), Handling Chair, Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Crops Chair, Calvin Walker (CW), Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair, Tracy Favre (TF), Livestock Chair, Jennifer Taylor (JT), sitting in, Colehour Bondera (CBo) - sitting in

Absent: Carmela Beck (CBe), CACS Chair

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Agenda

- **Call to Order** - JR
- **Approval of Notes:** September 12, 2014
- **Chairs Report**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
 - Comments/oral and written
 - Travel plans/logistics
- **NOP news and update** - MM
 - Workplans (**attached**)
 - Sunset review final template
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
 - Livestock (LS) - TF
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- **Notes of** September 12, 2014 were approved with no changes
- **Chairs Report**
 - The Chair noted that the 2015 NOSB appointees are very engaged and are actively seeking information and interaction with current Board members. Each new member will have a mentor when they begin their terms to help with the transition.
 - Dr. Lisa Brines will be the parliamentarian at the fall meeting, and the Chair is actively preparing for potentially complex motions.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** – MA
 - Comments/oral and written - There were approximately 1000 written comments, which were bundled and sent to the Board members last week, and 90 people signed up for oral comments at the fall meeting.

- Travel plans/logistics - MA asked that members contact her with any problems or questions about travel.
- **NOP news and update - MM**
 - The NOP posted a blog about the Northeast Organic Dairy Producers Alliance (NODPA) conference in New Hampshire and the future of organic certification
 - The NOP held an NOSB listening session yesterday during which they discussed the Sunset process, relayed information about the NOSB Charter renewal and subsequent changes, and requested comments and feedback about what is working well and what needs improvement with regard to the administration of the NOSB. Ten participants provided comments, which the NOP will respond to in writing.
 - The Deputy Administrator noted that he has been traveling and talking with many stakeholders including farmers, industry, and trade groups.
 - The group discussed the fall 2014 NOSB meeting and the desire to set a tone of collaboration with the community. The NOSB Vice Chair noted that the organic community is a very small component of the larger agricultural community, and therefore we should be a cohesive group and work together for the common good.
 - NOSB 2015 work agendas. Next year will be dominated by sunset reviews. MA asked for feedback about the agendas to make sure all of the information is accurate.
 - The project to look at “best practices for annotations” will be moved from the CACS to the PDS.
 - The NOP will be publishing a memo on BPA soon.
 - Sunset review final template. The NOP reviewed the three documents that the NOSB will use to conduct their sunset reviews. The NOSB Chair asked that after the fall 2014 meeting, the program review the documents and try to streamline them and rename them so they are more parallel. MM noted that the PDS will likely conduct this assessment. MA will send out coversheets and sunset review templates to each of the Subcommittee Chairs so they can complete them after the fall meeting.
 - The NOP recently sent a memo to NOSB regarding sunset voting at the meeting
 - Sodium nitrate - A member noted that as winter approaches and with it, the need to use sodium nitrate, stakeholders are asking when the rule will be out. The group discussed its global status: it is not used in Europe; Canada is looking at prohibition, and it is used more commonly in the US in New England and upper Midwest. The group considered options
 - Nanotech policy memo will be completed and published soon.
- **Subcommittee Reports**
 - **Crops (CS)** - ZS. Crops has been discussing public comments and has one more call before the fall meeting. The CS members are seeking to prepare for all potential motions on its sunset materials.
 - **Livestock (LS)** - TF. The LS is working very diligently on MET, and is inviting guest speakers to discuss the topic. The aquaculture legacy draft document was discussed on last call, and the LS Chair is incorporating feedback and will send it to the entire Board for more feedback. The goal of this document is to provide institutional memory to future iterations of the Board with regard to the aquaculture (AQ) materials review. The LS Chair will provide a verbal update at the fall 2014 meeting and will prepare a discussion document for the spring 2015 meeting. When asked why the AQ materials were not included on the spring 2015 work agendas, the LS Chair noted that the proposal deadline is at the end of February and it didn't seem feasible that the Aquaculture rule would be published by then. The Vaccines from Excluded Methods document was well received and the LS received lots of public comment.

- **Handling (HS)** - HA. The group discussed the 2015 draft work agenda noting that Gibberellic acid will be removed and Whole Algal Flour will not be recommended for addition to the NL and therefore likely will not be on the spring 2015 agenda. Comments regarding glycerin have led to discussions about possible revisions to the proposal by the Subcommittee and therefore it may not be voted on at the fall 2014 meeting. Instead it will likely be referred back to Subcommittee and be brought forth for a vote at the spring 2015 meeting. The HS Chair noted that this delay causes the review to coincide with its sunset date of 2017. The HS has been discussing the possibility of convening a panel on boiler additives. The HS Chair noted that the public commenters were not supportive of continuing use of the boiler additives.
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO)** - CW. The MS Chair noted that during the NOSB webinar Consumers Union indicated they would be “downgrading” their rating of the organic label, and he was interested in hearing more discussion about this at the fall 2014 meeting.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS)** - CBe. The Chair discussed the public comments. There were a couple of trends that emerged regarding the soil conservation document: the request that the CACS include both biodiversity and soil management practices. The CACS noted that they were tasked with a much narrower scope by the NOP and therefore those topics were not part of this project. The group discussed future work which could encompass a broader scope. The group was also asked about metrics, but it was not clear from the public comments whose metrics should be used. The NOP will provide additional guidance and noted that draft guidance on biodiversity will be out soon.
- **Additional Items - none**
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule:

September 12, 2014 1:00 ET

October 17, 2014 1:00 ET (last call before fall mtg)

November 14, 2014 1:00 ET (post-fall-mtg - new NOSB Officers and Subcomm Chairs)

December 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 7, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 27 - Oct 31

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, November 14, 2014, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Jean Richardson (JR), NOSB Chair; Tracy Favre (TF), Livestock Chair & NOSB Vice Chair; NOSB Vice Chair Emeritus, Harold Austin (HA), Handling Chair & NOSB Secretary; Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Crops Chair; Calvin Walker (CW), Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair; CACS Chair; Colehour Bondera (CBo) - sitting in, Jay Feldman

Absent: Mac Stone (MS), PDS Chair & NOSB Secretary Emeritus, Carmela Beck (CBe), CACS Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Agenda

- **Call to Order** - JR
- **Approval of Notes:** October 17, 2014
- **Chairs Report**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
 - Final recommendations
 - Travel vouchers
 - See Milestone table (see below)
- **NOP news and update** – JR for MM
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Livestock (LS) - TF
 - Handling (HS) - HA
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe
 - Crops (CS) - ZS
- **Additional Items**
 - **Training**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- The meeting was called to order
- **Notes of October 17, 2014** approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report**
 - Fall NOSB meeting debrief. The Chair conveyed her profound appreciation to Mac Stone, who coordinated many of the meeting logistics, including the Board dinner. She also thanked the entire Board for a very successful and collegial meeting, and noted that it was due to a group effort.
 - The entire Board found the pre-meeting to be extremely useful and necessary, and everyone was in support of incorporating this into future meetings. The pre-meeting was brief and was an opportunity to walk through the agenda for the meeting.
 - The logistics in the conference room were good and the members would like to replicate them.
 - The Chair noted her desire to complete a larger quantity of work at spring meeting and to reiterate to the community that they are a cohesive team, all working together.

- Feedback about fall 2014 from Board members: The pre-meeting was well organized, an appropriate length of time and extremely useful. The strategy, pre-planning, and tenor of meeting (control with a sense of humor) led to a successful meeting. It was very organized and everyone appreciated being able to converse ahead of time. Having public comment split into two blocks worked well. A member supported the idea of holding Subcommittee meetings prior to the NOSB meetings. The group was also supportive of holding fieldtrips before the NOSB meetings to visit local farms or operations. The members also discussed the length of the spring meeting given the number of 2017 sunset materials and asked about completing some of the reviews so the fall 2015 meeting isn't too long. NOP noted that there must be two meetings for sunset substances, and that 2017 review needs to be completed by the end of the October 2015 meeting. Other ideas and questions for meeting organization include grouping materials by National List section, reading the materials into the public record in groups rather than individually if possible, and how best to vote. The NOP will discuss this and let the group know.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Final recommendations - The NOP received the fall 2014 recommendations from the Board and is working on formatting and posting.
 - Travel vouchers - MA reminded folks to submit their travel vouchers.
 - See Milestone table (see below) - the spring 2015 milestone tables were added to the notes for each of the Subcommittees.
- **NOP news and update - JR reported out for MM, who was unable to participate on the call.**
 - Two NOP memos will be released this week: One on BPA in packaging materials and one on peer review. Both items will be added to the NOSB agendas for future work.
 - EBR gave a talk recently about Inerts to a trade group that represents pesticide and chemical manufacturers (CPDA.com)., and the EPA's Design for the Environment (DfE/EPA) will meet with NOP in a week and a half
 - In response to a question about the draft Classification of Materials Guidance, NOP noted the final version is still in development.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) - TF. The LS is focused primarily on MET and has scheduled speakers for future calls with the intention of scheduling more. The Aquaculture (AQ) legacy doc is being edited and will be circulated for presentation at the next NOSB meeting. The LS Chair will forward the doc to the NOP (EBR who will share it with Mark Bradley) to proofread and fact check the historical aspects. The intent of the document is to provide a "breadcrumb trail" for future Boards to be able to move the reviews forward.
 - Handling (HS) - HA. Fall 2014 meeting summary: Four sunset recommendations were sent to the NOP, and two proposals were referred back to the HS for more work. For spring 2015 the HS has five petitioned materials, potentially two more that are waiting for TRs, ten 2016 sunsets, many 2017 sunset materials, and will not convene a boiler additive panel, but instead if needed, invite a technical expert on a call. The HS discussed and implemented a transition plan for the members that are rotating off and the new members joining. HA asked that the NOP send the sunset checklists to the group so everyone is working on the most current versions. MA will resend the templates to the group. In support of the large workload, the HS has added two calls and will reschedule the Feb 3 call because it conflicted with travel for those members attending the NOSB new member training. HS will also add to their work agenda the project to look at BPA in packaging.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - CW. The MS has three items for spring 2015. The seed purity project will be placed on hold while a separate piece of it will be included in the project on Excluded Methods. The MS will also be working on Prevention Strategies for Excluded

Methods in Crops and Handling and will post the discussion document on Excluded Methods Terminology again to glean more public comment at the next NOSB meeting. The MS meets once a month and discussed adding a call.

- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - JR for CBe. The CACS is working on the next iteration of the Soil Conservation document, and will begin work on the Peer review process, for which the NOP will be sending a memo.
 - Crops (CS) - ZS. The CS recently received TRs for some materials, and has several petitions that are waiting for TRs. Additionally, they are reviewing two 2016 sunsets, and lots of 2017 sunsets, with 8 or 10 TRs in development. The Contamination in Farm Inputs doc will move forward as another discussion document for the next NOSB meeting and the CS will invite guest speakers to attend the calls to provide feedback. The NOP will keep the CS apprised of the work of the Inerts Working Group (IWG).
 - Policy Development (PDS) - JR for MS. There is a PDS meeting scheduled for Nov 25, and the group is hoping to have a draft of the Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM) for distribution before the call. The New Member Guide (NMG) also needs updating.
- **No additional items**
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule:

- October 17, 2014 1:00 ET
- November 14, 2014 1:00 ET
- December 12, 2014 1:00 ET
- January 9, 2015 1:00 ET
- February 13, 2015 1:00 ET
- March 13, 2015 1:00 ET
- April 10, 2015 1:00 ET (last meeting before Spr 2015 NOSB meeting)

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 31

