

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, November 19, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL); Logan Petrey (LP); Amy Bruch (observer)

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Staff: Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- 2027 Sunset: Poloxalene TR sufficiency
- 2027 Sunset: Formic acid
- 2027 Sunset: Magnesium hydroxide
- Meloxicam next steps
- Discuss possible additions to work agenda
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2027 Sunset: Poloxalene TR sufficiency** – TR was determined to be sufficient.
- **2027 Sunset: Formic acid** – The lead provided an overview and is mostly relying on information from last sunset review. This is a material used in apiculture.
- **2027 Sunset: Magnesium hydroxide** – The lead provided an overview. Last TR was done in 2007. The committee will want to get a new TR for the next sunset review because things change even for materials that are longstanding essential materials.
- **Meloxicam next steps** – The Board passed a recommendation at the fall 2024 meeting to allow meloxicam. The subcommittee discussed the contents of the cover letter for the final recommendation. Rulemaking, including another public comment period, is required to add new synthetic substances to the National List.
- **Discuss possible additions to work agenda**
 - When livestock are integrated with crop production systems, e.g. in an orchard, manure from the grazing livestock is considered an “application” of raw manure and therefore is subject to the 90/120 days-to-harvest restrictions. The subcommittee is interested in looking at this restriction and how to alleviate challenges for producers and align with FSMA regulations.
 - Commenters have voiced an interest in developing more detailed standards for swine production. The subcommittee considered if an expert panel would be helpful to identify specific areas of interest.
- **Additional Items** – Discussed schedule for submitting final sunset review documents for spring 2025.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

October 10, 2024 (Thursday 2:00 ET/11:00 PT) - meeting prep -cancelled (no quorum)

October 15, 2024 - cancelled (public comment webinars)

November 5, 2024 - cancelled. Election Day!

November 19, 2024

2027 Sunset: Poloxalene (KH) - TR sufficiency

2027 Sunset: Formic acid (KH)
 2027 Sunset: Magnesium hydroxide (NL)
 December 3, 2024
 2027 Sunset: Butorphanol (NPP)
 2027 Sunset: Flunixin (NPP)
 December 17, 2024
 2027 Sunset: Oxytocin (BC)
 January 7, 2025
 2027 Sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (FQ)
 2027 Sunset: Strychnine (FQ)
 January 21, 2025
 2027 Sunset: EPA List 4 Inerts (BC/NL)
 2027 Sunset: Excipients (BC/NL)
 Research Priorities (all)
 February 4, 2025
 February 18, 2025
 March 4, 2025
 March 18, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 17, 2025		Spr 2025
Annotation Changes: Iodine	NL	Annotation change work agenda item approved May 2024.		Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 12.3.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 12.3.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 11.19.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24 12.17.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Sep 2024. TR sent to LS 9.20.24. Suff due 11.19.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24	4.2.24 5.21.24 11.19.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.19.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930 TR due mid Dec 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 1.21.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 1.21.25	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 1.7.25	“ “

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Dec 6, 2024	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 2, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Tempe, AZ	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11
NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, September 3, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review August 20, 2024 notes
- Assign dates for 2027 sunset review discussions
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 20, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2027 sunset review discussions.** The LS members reviewed the work agenda, and scheduled discussion dates for the 2027 sunsets (see table below). The LS noted the transition in personnel that will occur after the Fall meeting and before the Spring meeting, and discussed how to transition in-progress documents. Two members of the Livestock Subcommittee will rotate off the Board in January.
- **Additional Items.** The LS cancelled a couple of Subcommittee calls and will meet again on October 10.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

August 20, 2024.

Discuss bigger picture items (swine)

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024 - cancelled

October 1, 2024 - cancelled

October 10, 2024 (Thursday 2:00 ET/11:00 PT) - meeting prep

October 15, 2024 - cancelled (public comment webinars)

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

2027 Sunset: Poloxalene (KH)

2027 Sunset: Formic acid (KH)

2027 Sunset: Magnesium hydroxide (NL)

December 3, 2024

2027 Sunset: Butorphanol (NPP)

2027 Sunset: Flunixin (NPP)

December 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Oxytocin (BC)

January 7, 2025

2027 Sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (FQ)

2027 Sunset: Strychnine (FQ)

January 21, 2025

2027 Sunset: EPA List 4 Inerts (BC/NL)

2027 Sunset: Excipients (BC/NL)

Research Priorities (all)

February 4, 2025

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24.	4.16.24 5.21.24 6.4.24 6.18.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24 1.21.25	Fall 2024
Annotation Changes: Iodine DL - Methionine	NL	Annotation change work agenda item approved May 2024.	8.6.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	6.4.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.16.24	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP/ NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: Lmtd Scope 2024 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	6.18.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	--	------------------------------	-----

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 12.3.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 12.3.24	“ “

Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 11.19.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24 12.17.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Sep 2024	4.2.24 5.21.24 11.19.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.19.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930 TR due mid Dec 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 1.21.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 1.21.25	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 1.7.25	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, August 20, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review August 6, 2024 notes
- Discuss bigger picture items (swine)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 6, 2024 notes** were approved with modifications and corrections of a couple of typos.
- **Discuss bigger picture items (swine).** The LS Chair invited members to offer suggestions for additional work agenda items.
 - Swine is included in the research priorities, and the group revisited the document as a jumping off point for future work in this area. A member suggested a panel on organic pork for a future call - possibly in the Midwest. Another member mentioned two barriers - processing and feed.
 - The Chair suggested a possible discussion document for the Spring 2025 meeting to solicit feedback from stakeholders.
 - Members offered other ideas for “bigger picture” projects that the Livestock Subcommittee could possibly work on. A member suggested keeping market development in the back of their minds as they are working on topics, while also acknowledging that it is not part of the NOSB’s mandate. The group also discussed global markets, imports, volatility, and results from the strengthening organic enforcement (SOE) rule.
 - Parasiticides. Baseline literature review is underway by the Food Technologist.
 - Aquaculture.
 - Apiculture
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Vitamins (BC)

Methionine (NPP/NL)

Xylazine (NPP)

Tolazoline (NPP)

Meloxicam (NPP/KH) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024.

Discuss bigger picture items (swine)

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024
 October 1, 2024
 October 15, 2024
 November 5, 2024
 November 19, 2024
 December 3, 2024
 December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24.	4.16.24 5.21.24 6.4.24 6.18.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024
Annotation Changes: Iodine DL - Methionine	NL	Annotation change work agenda item approved May 2024.	8.6.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	6.4.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.16.24	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP/ NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: Lmtd Scope 2024 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	6.18.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	--	------------------------------	-----

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “

Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Sep 2024	4.2.24 5.21.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930 TR due mid Dec 2024	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, August 6, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review July 16, 2024 notes
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Vitamins (BC)
 - Methionine (NPP/NL)
 - Xylazine (NPP)
 - Tolazoline (NPP)
- Meloxicam (NPP/KH) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
 - DL - Methionine annotation change
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 16, 2024 notes** were approved as written
- **2026 sunsets - discuss/vote**
 - **Vitamins (BC).** The lead gave a brief update and the LS moved to a vote. The document includes changes based on information from a previous discussion.

Motion to remove vitamins from the National List

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Methionine (NPP/NL).** The co-lead summarized previous comments regarding methionine, highlighting the importance to the poultry industry. Based on follow up conversation, he will add a sentence about prohibition of slaughter waste.

Motion to remove DL methionine from the National List

Motion by: NPP

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Xylazine, Tolazoline (NPP).** The lead briefly summarized the two substances noting that they are used in conjunction with each other. The LS is reviewing tolazoline early, as the two substances have different sunset dates. They moved to vote on each separately.

Motion to remove xylazine from the National List

Motion by: NPP

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

Motion to remove tolazoline from the National List

Motion by: NPP

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Meloxicam (NPP/KH).** The lead summarized the petition which was submitted by a cohort of veterinarians. Meloxicam is used as a pain management tool. It is a chemical formulation and does not involve the potential use of excluded methods, has no environmental concerns based on manufacturing, and appears to be needed by the industry. In lieu of requesting a TR, the leads included additional information gleaned from personal research and the petition, and felt they had all the information they needed. The co-lead highlighted the language about the use of this material under the order of a veterinarian. The LS moved to a vote.

Motion to classify meloxicam as synthetic

Motion by: NPP

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

Motion to add meloxicam to the National List at § 205.603(a)

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: NPP

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **DL - Methionine annotation change (NL).** The lead proposed an annotation change to methionine to remove the caps and the group discussed the draft proposal that was circulated earlier today. The current annotation on DL-Methionine limits inclusion rates of the substance to 2 pounds per ton of feed for laying hens, 2.5 pounds per ton of feed for broiler chickens, and 3 pounds per ton of feed for turkeys and all other poultry. The annotation also allows for this limit to be averaged over the lifetime of the flock, so that producers can adjust the feed ration as needed during the lifecycle of the bird. The LS indicates that the limits can prevent producers from providing adequate nutrition to their flocks which has serious health impacts on organic poultry, does not align with our largest trading partners, Canada and the EU, and does not appear to have hastened the development of natural alternatives. Additionally, they report that a certifier commented at the Spring meeting that the paperwork is burdensome to producers and inspectors. The LS moved to a vote.

Motion to amend the annotation of DL - Methionine on the National List at 7 CFR 205.603(d)(1) as follows: DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium (CAS #'s 59-51-8, 583-91-5, 4857-44-7, and 922-50-9)—for use only in organic poultry production ~~at the following pounds of synthetic 100 percent methionine per ton of feed in the diet, maximum rates as averaged per ton of feed over the life of the flock: Laying chickens—2 pounds; broiler chickens—2.5 pounds; turkeys and all other poultry—3 pounds.~~

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional Items.** The group discussed the process for annotation changes, which was approved by the NOP in May 2023. NOP and members also discussed improvements to the process to ensure that each candidate for annotation change is listed on the Subcommittee work agenda to support transparency and work plan management.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

July 16, 2024

Research Priorities

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Vitamins (BC)

Fenbendazole (NPP)

Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH)

Moxidectin (KH)

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Vitamins (BC)

Methionine (NPP/NL)

Xylazine (NPP)

Tolazoline (NPP)

Meloxicam (NPP/KH) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024.

Discuss bigger picture items (swine)

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24.	4.16.24 5.21.24 6.4.24 6.18.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
---------	---------	-------	------------------	----------------

Research Priorities	BC/All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024
Annotation Changes: Iodine DL -Methionine	NL	Annotation change work agenda item approved May 2024.	8.6.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	6.4.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “

Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.16.24	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP/ NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: Lmtd Scope 2024 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	6.18.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 5.21.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, July 16, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL)

Absent: Heather Kumar (HK)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review June 18, 2024 notes
- Research Priorities - discuss
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Vitamins (BC)
 - Fenbendazole (NPP)
 - Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH)
 - Moxidectin (KH)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 18, 2024 notes** were approved with no changes.
- **Research Priorities (All).** The LS Chair summarized the current list of priorities and highlighted written comments from the Spring meeting. The group discussed what to include and will forward the list to the MS for the August 13 call.
- **2026 sunsets - discuss/vote**
 - **Vitamins (BC).** The lead summarized the manufacturing methods for vitamins, and the group discussed potential excluded methods. The LS will continue the discussion and will vote on the next call.
 - **Fenbendazole (NPP).** The lead gave a brief summary of fenbendazole, noting that commenters were supportive of relisting, and that the Fall proposal would not look different from the Spring version. The LS moved to a vote and the lead will finalize the document and send it to the Chair and NOP.

Motion to remove fenbendazole from the National List

Motion by: NPP

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH).** The lead provided a brief summary and noted that this substance is not controversial. The LS moved to a vote. The lead will finalize the review and submit it for the Fall meeting.

Motion to remove oxalic acid dihydrate from the National List 205.603(b)

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Moxidectin (KH).** The lead summarized the uses of moxidectin, one of several parasiticides on the National List. Commenters and the LS were supportive of relisting. A member pointed out a reference to 205.600 in the justification section of the sunset templates, which only applies to Handling. NOP will modify the templates.

Motion to remove moxidectin from the National List

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Additional Items. The lead authors for meloxicam** are finalizing the proposal, and the LS will discuss and vote on the document during the August 6 call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

June 18, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Atropine (FQ)

Hydrogen Peroxide (FQ)

Trace Minerals (BC)

Vitamins (BC)

Moxidectin (KH) - discuss

July 2, 2024 - cancelled

July 16, 2024

Research Priorities

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Vitamins (BC)

Fenbendazole (NPP)

Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH)

Moxidectin (KH)

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Vitamins (BC)

Methionine (NPP/NL)

Xylazine (NPP)

Tolazoline (NPP)

Meloxicam (NPP/KH) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024.

Discuss bigger picture items (swine)

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24.	4.16.24 5.21.24 6.4.24 6.18.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	6.4.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “

Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.16.24	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP/ NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: Lmtd Scope 2024 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	6.18.24 7.16.24 8.6.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “

Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 5.21.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, June 18, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

Absent: Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Mirinda (JM)

Agenda

- Review June 4, 2024 notes
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Atropine (FQ)
 - Hydrogen Peroxide (FQ)
 - Trace Minerals (BC)
 - Vitamins (BC)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 4, 2024 notes** were approved with modifications to the meloxicam discussion.
- **2026 sunsets - discuss/vote**
 - **Atropine (FQ).** The lead summarize the review and highlighted public comments from the Spring meeting. Commenters were supportive of relisting. Many mentioned that atropine is necessary, and used only as an emergency measure, and when used properly it's safe.

Motion to remove atropine from the National List

Motion by: FQ

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 3 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Hydrogen peroxide (FQ).** The lead summarized the uses, human and environmental health issues, and previous public comments. Hydrogen is an invaluable tool, and has little to no impacts.

Motion to remove hydrogen peroxide from the National List

Motion by: FQ

Seconded by: NPP

Yes: 0 No: 3 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Trace minerals (BC).** The lead summarized the review for trace minerals, noting public comments that indicated trace minerals should only be used when forage is low in minerals.

Motion to remove trace minerals from the National List

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: NPP

Yes: 0 No: 3 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Vitamins (BC).** The lead summarized the review of vitamins, and based on feedback from members made some modifications to the document. The lead noted the complexity involved

and highlighted the NOP guidance document 5030 and the [NOP 5030-1 \(Response to Comments\)](#), which provides context for understanding the 5030 guidance document. The NOSB Chair added some background from the certifier community, and will circulate the Accredited Certifiers Association (ACA) Best Practices for GMO Vitamins and Livestock Feed. The group discussed the use of affidavits from manufacturers disclosing GMOs in certain ingredients. The LS deferred the vote to a later call.

- **Moxidectin (NPP).** One of the co-leads provided additional information about excluded methods, which was an action item from the last call. He confirmed that the parent material is produced from a chemical, not biological, process, and therefore not created with excluded methods. Based on this feedback the LS determined they didn't need a TR, and will proceed with a proposal for the Fall 2024 meeting.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

June 4, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Iodine (NL)

PAA (NL)

Mag Sulfate (BC)

June 18, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Atropine (FQ)

Hydrogen Peroxide (FQ)

Trace Minerals (BC)

Vitamins (BC)

Moxidectin (KH) - discuss

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

Research Priorities

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Vitamins (BC)

Fenbendazole (NPP)

Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH)

Moxidectin (KH)

Meloxicam (NPP/KH) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Methionine (NPP/NL)

Xylazine (NPP)

Tolazoline (NPP)

August 20, 2024.

Discuss bigger picture items (swine)

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024
 October 15, 2024
 November 5, 2024
 November 19, 2024
 December 3, 2024
 December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24.	4.16.24 5.21.24 6.4.24 6.18.24 7.16.24	Fall 2024
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	6.4.24	“ “

Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.16.24	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP/ NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: Lmtd Scope 2024 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	6.18.24 7.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “

Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 5.21.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, June 4, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Kyla Smith - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review May 21, 2024 notes
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Iodine (NL)
 - PAA (NL)
 - Mag Sulfate (BC)
 - Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **May 21, 2024 notes** were
- **2026 sunsets - discuss/vote**
 - **Iodine (NL).** The lead summarized iodine and noted that the LS is also proposing an annotation restricting the use of alkylphenol ethoxylates in the manufacture.

Motion to remove iodine at 205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to amend the listing for iodine at 205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4). Iodine must be without the use of alkylphenol ethoxylates

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: FQ

Additional discussion: Members discussed excipients vs. amendments, noting that volume and use patterns are different.

Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

The NOSB will submit a separate document with the recommendations for annotation changes, as the rulemaking process for those will be separate from the sunset renewals.

- **Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic (PAA) (NL).** There was little discussion at the Spring meeting, and it appears that this material is not controversial

Motion to remove Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic (PAA) from the National List

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Magnesium Sulfate (BC).** The lead summarized the uses of magnesium sulfate. There was strong support from the community to continue listing, no health or environmental downsides, and is listed as Generally Regarded as Safe (GRAS). The LS asked a question at the Spring meeting about non-synthetic sulfate products and will ask the question again, as they didn't get any answers.

Motion to remove magnesium sulfate at 205.603(a)

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional Items.**

- **Meloxicam (NPP/KH).** The leads compiled a review of the petition using the evaluation criteria as a guide, to assist the LS in its determination about requesting a new TR. Members view the petition as thorough and comprehensive, providing all the appropriate information they needed to make a decision. However, they will confirm materials used in manufacturing do not raise concerns about excluded methods. The Subcommittee will proceed to a proposal and will discuss and vote at a future call.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

May 21, 2024

June 4, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Iodine (NL)

PAA (NL)

Mag Sulfate (BC)

June 18, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Atropine (FQ)

Hydrogen Peroxide (FQ)

Trace Minerals (BC)

Vitamins (BC)

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

Research Priorities

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Fenbendazole (NPP)

Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH)

Moxidectin (KH)

Meloxicam (NPP/KH) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Methionine (NPP/NL)

Xylazine (NPP)

Tolazoline (NPP)

August 20, 2024.

Discuss bigger picture items (swine)

- September 3, 2024
- September 17, 2024
- October 1, 2024
- October 15, 2024
- November 5, 2024
- November 19, 2024
- December 3, 2024
- December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24.	4.16.24 5.21.24 6.4.24 7.16.24	Fall 2024
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	6.4.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	6.18.24	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP/ NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: Lmtd Scope 2024 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	6.18.24	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	--	---------	-----

Milestones

NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “

Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 5.21.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, May 21, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Lewis (NL)

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review April 16, 2024 notes
- Spring meeting debrief
- TRs for 2027 sunsets
- Schedule dates for discussion of 2026 sunsets
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 16, 2024 notes** were accepted with minor changes.
- **Spring meeting debrief (All).** Members discussed various aspects of the in-person meetings, sharing pros and cons. Members were supportive of in-person public comments and thought it was a positive experience. It was helpful hearing from veterinarians and industry members supporting meloxicam, and methionine. Members also discussed the proposed rule on petfood, and wondered if they would get more comments at the Fall meeting. The LS Chair added ideas for future conversations about larger scope items, such as fluctuation in grain prices, humane swine standards and increasing organic pork supply, the impending information on parasiticide (i.e., research from the Food Technologist), fish oil/marine products, and the lack of standards.
- **TRs for 2027 sunsets.** The LS finalized the list of TR requests, with the confirmation of a limited scope TR for poloxalene. The LS will request two limited scope TRs.
- **Schedule dates for discussion of 2026 sunsets.** The LS scheduled discussion dates for the 2026 sunset review (see table below). All draft documents are due to the LS ahead of time, so members have adequate time to read them.
- **Additional Items.** The LS rediscussed the need for a TR for Meloxicam, and will continue the discussion on the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

May 7, 2024 - cancelled

May 21, 2024

June 4, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Iodine (NL)

PAA (NL)

Mag Sulfate (BC)

Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH)

June 18, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Atropine (FQ)
 Hydrogen Peroxide (FQ)
 Trace Minerals (BC)
 Vitamins (BC)

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

Research Priorities

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Fenbendazole (NPP)

Moxidectin (KH)

Meloxicam (NPP/KH)

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Methionine (NPP/NL)

Xylazine (NPP)

Tolazoline (NPP)

August 20, 2024.

Discuss bigger picture items (swine,

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24.	4.16.24 5.21.24 7.16.24	Fall 2024
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	6.4.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	6.4.24	“ “

DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP/NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: Lmtd Scope 2024 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	6.18.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	--------------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 5.21.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, April 16, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Nate Lewis (NL)

Absent: Esu Obu (EO)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK);

Agenda

- Review April 2, 2024 notes
- Meloxicam - TR determination
- 2027 Sunset TR Determinations
 - Butorphanol (NPP)
 - Flunixin (NPP)
 - Magnesium hydroxide (NL)
 - Sucrose octanoate esters (FQ)
- Additional Items.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 2, 2024 notes** were approved as written.
- **Meloxicam (NPP/KH) - TR determination.** The lead reached out for feedback from a veterinarian about possible excluded methods used in the manufacture process. The leads do not think there is a need for a TR, but would revisit if there was space for an additional TR. The petition was thorough and Board member background and expertise, combined with feedback from stakeholders and veterinarians, they are going to move forward with a proposal. A member emphasized the need to justify why they would not request a TR for a new petitioned material.
- **2027 Sunset TR Determinations**
 - **Butorphanol (NPP).** The lead summarized butorphanol, and noted that usage and manufacture have not changed since the last sunset review, and does not feel the need to request a new TR. Members discussed pain management in general.
 - **Flunixin (NPP).** The lead summarized the use and need for flunixin which is used for pain management. Used on a localized basis and never on the entire herd, so doesn't feel need for new TR.
 - **Magnesium hydroxide (NL).** Used as a laxative to relieve constipation. Last TAP was from 2007. On list with restrictive annotation. Requires veterinarian approval. Recommendation would be to not request a new TR. Livestock list is about animal welfare, and is overseen by FDA and veterinarians, so it is lower risk. The group discussed alternatives, and noted the language used in the annotations about veterinarian approval. No new TR requested.
 - **Sucrose octanoate esters (SOE) (FQ).** The lead noted that the last TR was from 2005, and was comprehensive. The group discussed uses outside of Livestock, as it is also listed for Crops scope. The LS will not request a new TR. The group also discussed the review history of SOE. NOSB voted to remove in 2018 and the NOP received new info in the comment period, so it was not removed.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

April 2, 2024

Meloxicam - Petition sufficiency and TR determination

April 16, 2024

Meloxicam (KH/NPP) - TR determination

2027 sunsets: TR determinations

Butorphanol (NPP)

Flunixin (NPP)

Magnesium hydroxide (NL)

Sucrose octanoate esters (FQ)

May 7, 2024

May 21, 2024

June 4, 2024

June 18, 2024

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

August 6, 2024

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24		TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	1.23.24 2.6.24	Fall 2023

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “

DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23 1.23.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24 3.19.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	--------------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, April 2, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Nate Lewis (NL); Esu Obu (EO)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review March 19, 2024 notes
- Meloxicam - Petition sufficiency and TR determination
- 2027 Sunset TR Determinations
 - Oxytocin (BC)
 - Poloxalene (KH)
 - Formic acid (KH)
 - EPA List 4 Inerts (BC/NL)
 - Excipients (BC/NL)
 - Strychnine (FQ)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 19, 2024 notes** were approved with minor edits.
- **Meloxicam (KH/NPP) - Petition sufficiency and TR determination.** The LS members briefly discussed the petition for meloxicam, noting that it is FDA approved, and has no known side effects. The petition was found sufficient, and the group will revisit this conversation on the next call to determine the need for a Technical Report.
- **2027 Sunset TR Determinations**
 - **Oxytocin (BC).** The lead indicated that at the last sunset there was a recommendation to remove oxytocin, however the NOP did not implement that recommendation. At this time, the LS will not request a TR, and is looking forward to public comment for the Spring 2025 meeting.
 - **Poloxalene (KH).** The lead noted that poloxalene is used internally for bloat management, and is a substance managed by the FDA. At the last sunset review it was approved unanimously. The TAP is from 2001, and it seems to be thorough. The LS will mark this as a potential candidate for a new limited scope TR, based on the age of the last one, the lack of international information in the TAP, and to explore any manufacturing changes.
 - **Formic acid (KH).** Used in beekeeping. Seems non-controversial, and ubiquitous. No new TR.
 - **EPA List 4 Inerts (BC/NL).** There has never been a TR, because it involves hundreds of substances. List 4 inerts are currently under review by the Materials Subcommittee and the NOP has asked that the NOSB determine a path forward before the next sunset date. The LS will not request a TR.
 - **Excipients (BC/NL).** Similar to inerts, it's a group of substances - 8000 according to the 2015 TR. The LS will not request a new TR. The previous TR did indicate that some excipients are made with excluded methods. By default, excluded methods are not allowed except in vaccines, which must be approved for use.
 - **Strychnine (FQ).** The lead summarized strychnine, which is prohibited for use. It's non-synthetic and toxic, and there is no argument to allow it in organic. The LS will not request a TR.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

March 19, 2024

Meloxicam petition - assign lead/discuss

April 2, 2024

Meloxicam - Petition sufficiency and TR determination

April 16, 2024

Meloxicam (KH/NPP) - TR determination

2027 sunsets: TR determinations

Butorphanol (NPP)

Flunixin (NPP)

Magnesium hydroxide (NL)

Sucrose octanoate esters (FQ)

May 7, 2024

May 21, 2024

June 4, 2024

June 18, 2024

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

August 6, 2024

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. **Highlight** indicates action needed. **Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24	3.19.24 4.16.24	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
---------	---------	-------	-------------------	----------------

Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	1.23.24 2.6.24	Fall 2023
---------------------	--------	--	-------------------	-----------

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “

Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23 1.23.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24 3.19.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Maybe Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
----------------------------	------------	----	---	---	--------	-----

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, March 19, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review February 6, 2024 notes
- Meloxicam petition - assign lead/discuss
- 2026 Sunsets: Vitamins - discuss TR (BC)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 6, 2024 notes** were reviewed and accepted via email prior to the call.
- **Meloxicam petition - assign lead/discuss.** The NOSB received a petition for meloxicam, a non-steroidal pain reliever. The petition came from a group of veterinarians, not a manufacturer. KH and NPP volunteered to co-lead.
- **2026 Sunsets: Vitamins - discuss TR (BC).** The lead reviewed the TR and determined it was sufficient. He noted that fermentation is used to manufacture some vitamins. The group reviewed the questions they asked of stakeholders in the spring sunset review, which was completed before the TR was received. The lead noted that the conversation around fermentation extends beyond livestock, and in livestock, vitamins are critical to health and wellbeing.
- **2027 TRs.** Assigned leads, TR determinations are due to NOP by late May. The LS has three meetings to discuss and decide and scheduled those conversations for April 2 and April 16. See table below.
- **Additional Items.**
 - **Fermentation.** The LS discussed fermentation and noted that it is a broad topic and spans across several Subcommittees.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

February 6, 2024

2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024 - cancelled

March 5, 2024 - cancelled

March 19, 2024

Meloxicam petition - assign lead/discuss

April 2, 2024

Meloxicam - Petition sufficiency and TR determination

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency due 4.21.24	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	1.23.24 2.6.24	Fall 2023

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “

Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23 1.23.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24 3.19.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
------------------------	--------------------------	------------------------------

NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, February 6, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 23, 2024 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/finalize
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 23, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP), Moxidectin (KH).** The leads summarized the use of parasiticides. Both leads spoke with a couple of stakeholders/veterinarians to collect feedback about the use of these medicines and the current restrictions (annotations). The feedback they received is that in acute situations, moxidectin is a necessity for organic livestock; it should not be used as a routine practice. The annotation is robust. The LS supports re-listing as written and does not expect any controversy. A member mentioned that there is language in the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPS) rule regarding parasite control plans, which will be implemented at the beginning of 2025. The LS will add/modify the questions and submit the final reviews for the Spring meeting.
- **Research Priorities (All).** The group reviewed the research priorities and the results of the prioritization exercise. The LS will submit its top two priorities and three items that are ongoing priorities.
- **Additional Items.** The Chair proposed a potential work request for the Food Technologists for a literature search/analysis on parasites across species and regions and will submit the request to the NOSB Chair and NOP.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

January 23, 2024

- Research Priorities (All) - discuss
- 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss questions
- 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	1.23.24 2.6.24	Fall 2023

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “

Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23 1.23.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due Feb 16	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20

NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, January 23, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 16, 2024 notes
- 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss questions
- 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 16, 2024 notes** were approved with minor revisions.
- **2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP).** The LS reviewed the questions to stakeholders in the draft review, made some modifications, and discussed how to add some of the topics to Research Priorities. The lead will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ).** The lead summarized atropine, which is a naturally occurring substance produced from plants in the nightshade family. It is used in humans as well as livestock, and it is used only on the recommendation of a licensed veterinarian. There are restrictions about post-use handling of animals, so risks are low. The lead summarized international acceptance, and human and environmental health, and the group discussed classification. To glean more information, members suggested questions to stakeholders, and the LS will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ).** The lead summarized the review and noted the ancillary substances. Hydrogen peroxide is Generally Regarded as Safe (GRAS), considered safe at low doses, and the breakdown products are benign. There were no questions to stakeholders. The lead will submit the review to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP).** The lead thanked the previous lead for prior work, and summarized the two substances that are used in conjunction with each other in veterinary surgical procedures for livestock. Xylazine is used as a sedative, and tolazoline counteracts it. These substances are critical to humane livestock husbandry, and are controlled by veterinarians. The lead will complete the documents and submit them to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **Research Priorities (All).** The lead gave a brief update on research priorities. He asked members to look at the current list and identify top 2 or 3 priorities out of the 7. The LS will complete the list on the next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review

January 23, 2024

Research Priorities (All) - discuss
 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss questions
 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024

2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review
 Research Priorities (All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	7.18.23 1.23.24 2.6.24	Fall 2023

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “

Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23 1.23.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “

Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due Feb 16	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	--	---	-----

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, January 16, 2024, 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review December 19, 2023 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review
- 2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 19, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL).** The lead summarized the limited scope TR, and highlighted information regarding nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). The TR was found sufficient, and the LS Chair will relay that information to the NOP. The lead also summarized the review for iodine, including its uses, manufacture, excipients, and human health and environmental issues. The LS finds iodine essential and is not proposing removal, however, they are interested in exploring an annotation to restrict the formulas to NPE-free versions. Members asked several questions about NPEs, and NOP pointed out previous work by the Crops Subcommittee on this topic: <https://www.ams.usda.gov/sites/default/files/media/CSDDNPEApr2016.pdf>. The lead will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC).** The lead summarized the review, noting the importance of vitamins in animal nutrition, and the fact that they are used in small amounts. The group discussed B vitamins specifically, and will include a question about the need/use. A member reminded the group about the terminology when talking about substances: For Crops and Livestock it's "necessity", and for Handling it is "essentiality". The Chair will submit the final review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH).** Deferred to later call.
- **2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP).** Deferred to later call.
- **Research Priorities (All).** Deferred to later call.
- **Additional Items.** MET lead will provide the members will several questions by the end of the week for discussion on the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

December 19, 2023

- 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic (NL) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review

January 23, 2024

- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss questions
- 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Category	Status	Notes	Target Meeting
Aquaculture Substances			On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	7.18.23 1.23.24	Fall 2023

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “

Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “

Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due Feb 16	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	--	---	-----

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting